

# Notes on the Study of *Merkabah* Mysticism and *Hekhalot* Literature in English

*with an appendix on Jewish Magic*

Don Karr

© Don Karr, 1982-5, updated 1995-2013 Email: [dk0618@yahoo.com](mailto:dk0618@yahoo.com)

All rights reserved.

## License to Copy

This publication is intended for personal use only. Paper copies may be made for personal use.

With the above exception, no part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, without permission in writing from the author.

Reviewers may quote brief passages.

The original version of this article appeared as an appendix to the fourth edition of *A Guide to Kabbalistic Books in English: 1977-1979*, by Don Karr (Ithaca: 1982), pp. 37-40; it was reprinted in slightly expanded form in *Collected Articles on the Kabbalah*, volume 1, by D. Karr (Ithaca: KoM #5, 1985), pages 17-20, which is reprinted below as APPENDIX 2.

MERKABAH (= CHARIOT) MYSTICISM developed primarily out of speculation on and expansion of the visions of Ezekiel (CHAPTERS 1, 8, and 10) and, to a lesser extent, Isaiah (CHAPTER 6) and Daniel (CHAPTER 2). This strain of mysticism meanders through the intertestamental pseudepigrapha<sup>1</sup> and even touches corners of gnostic and Qumran texts.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> 1 Enoch 14; The Life of Adam and Eve (including The Apocaylipse of Moses); The Apocaylipse of Abraham. For translations of these, see James H. Charlesworth (ed.), *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, Volume 1 (Garden City: Doubleday and Company, 1983).

1 Enoch 14 is particularly important. Gruenwald (in AMM, p. 36) says, "...it is the oldest Merkavah vision we know of from outside the canonical Scriptures. ... Indeed, one can consider this particular vision a model-vision of Merkavah Mysticism." (AMM = *Apocalyptic and Merkavah Mysticism*—see below, page 4, **1980** • Gruenwald.)

<sup>2</sup> On *merkabah* in gnostic works: (texts) "The Hypostasis of the Archons" and "On the Origin of the World," in James M. Robinson (ed.), *The Nag Hammadi Library in English* (Leiden: E. J. Brill / San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1977; revised edition, Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996); Ithamar Gruenwald's article, "Jewish Merkavah Mysticism and Gnosticism," in *Studies in Jewish Mysticism*, edited by J. Dan and F. Talmage (Cambridge: Association for Jewish Studies, 1982).

On *merkabah* in Qumran works (= Dead Sea Scrolls): David Halperin, FACES (= *The Faces of the Chariot*, see below, page 6: **1988** • Halperin); Geza Vermes, *The Dead Sea Scrolls in English* (London: Penguin Books, 1987): § 12; Florentino Garcia Martinez, *The Dead Sea Scrolls Translated* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1994): pages 419-431; M. Wise, M. Abegg, and E. Cook, *The Dead Sea Scrolls: A New Translation* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1996): pages 365-377 (includes the "Masada Fragment"). Refer also to the list on pages 16 and 17 below: "Regarding the *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice*."

*Merkabah* material and references can be found in shreds, often more provocative than telling, in the Talmud and other rabbinic writings.<sup>3</sup> However, the major concentrated expression of *merkabah* mysticism is that cluster of writings which has come to be called the *hekhalot* (= HEAVENLY HALLS) literature, which is the focus of this paper.

Arguments over the dating of this body of literature continue, but there is general agreement to a range of 200-800 C.E. The bounds and structure of these writings are also matters of dispute, for the notions of titles and fixed contents of a specific canon of *hekhalot* books appear to be more academic conveniences than reflections of the true nature or state of the literature.

Since the 'seventies, scholarly work on the *hekhalot* texts has increased dramatically, as the publication dates on a clear majority of the books and articles discussed below attest. Before this spate of academic activity, there were in English little more than Gershom Scholem's works<sup>4</sup> and Hugo Odeberg's attempt at a critical edition of one of the *hekhalot* texts<sup>5</sup> to shed light on this oblique collection of writings. Even as this lament is being recalled, no time should be lost in acknowledging Scholem's inescapable influence on this and all other aspects of the study of Jewish mysticism. Some of Scholem's conclusions regarding the *hekhalot* have been challenged, and some of his observations on and characterizations of the *hekhalot* texts have come to seem convenient, imposing order on that which is, in fact, near chaos. Yet, Scholem's writings on this subject remain some of the clearest and best supported; they are also among the most accessible, not only in their style but in their actual availability.

As for Odeberg, his lone work is more problematic. As significant as it was, Odeberg's treatment of *Sefer ha-Hekhalot* (BOOK OF THE HEKHALOT, dubbed by Odeberg "3 Enoch") is now considered unreliable and misleading on many points. But, as contemporary scholar David Halperin has pointed out, Odeberg's work has "proved easier to criticize than to emulate."<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> Mishnah: *Megillah* 4:10, *Haggigah* 2:7, *Tosefta Haggigah* 2:1-7, Palestinian Talmud 77 a-d; Babylonian Talmud 11b-16a. See the books listed below by 1980 • Halperin and 1982 • Chernus on page 5, and 2009 • Schäfer on page 20.

<sup>4</sup> A list of Scholem's works is given below, page 4.

Morton Smith's "Observations on Hekhalot Rabbati," in *Biblical and Other Studies*, edited by Alexander Altmann (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1963) was another early notice. Also, Smith translated *Hekhalot Rabbati* into English—a project which began in the 'forties and lasted until the 'eighties, when Smith worked on the translation in collaboration with Ithamar Gruenwald. At some point, the typescript was corrected by Scholem, who mentions Smith's translation in *Jewish Gnosticism...*, page 11, note 4. This translation circulated among a few scholars in the field but was never published. A transcription of Smith's *Hekhalot Rabbati* is now online at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/HekRab/index.php>. See below, page 23: § A.

<sup>5</sup> 3 Enoch or The Hebrew Book of Enoch (1928, Cambridge University Press; reprinted New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1973: with a prolegomenon by Jonas C. Greenfield).

<sup>6</sup> FACES, p. 364. (See below, page 6: 1988 • Halperin).

Today, however, we are in pretty fair shape to study *merkabah* mysticism and *hekhalot* texts, though some of the leading scholars in this field publish in German<sup>7</sup> and, of course, Hebrew. Nevertheless, from the texts and studies now available in English, the persistent reader can certainly gain firm impressions of

- (i) the contents of the *hekhalot* texts,
- (ii) the issues captivating contemporary scholarship regarding the *hekhalot* texts, and
- (iii) the place of the *hekhalot* texts in the history and development of Judaism, early Christianity, and their mysticism.<sup>8</sup>

In the following pages, books, sections of books, and articles on *merkabah* mysticism and *hekhalot* literature—including translations—are described. I also discuss the various texts associated, however loosely, with the *hekhalot* corpus, with indications of sources for translations and studies of these.

---

<sup>7</sup> For the most part in German, there is the work of Peter Schäfer and his team, Margarete Schlüter and Georg von Mutius. Certainly, the most significant work which Schäfer has overseen is *Synopse zur Hekhalot-Literatur* (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1981), which presents in the original Hebrew and Aramaic an array of manuscript readings side by side. *Synopse* was followed by *Geniza-Fragmente zur Hekhalot-Literatur* by the same team (Mohr/Siebeck: 1984). Soon after, German translations of *Synopse* appeared (Mohr/Siebeck, 1987 onward). Schäfer has also published a collection of his articles—ten in German, three in English—as *Hekhalot-Studien* (Mohr/Siebeck, 1988).

<sup>8</sup> Refer to Ra'anan S. Boustan's article, "The Study of Heikhalot Literature: Between Mystical Experience and Textual Artifact," in *Currents in Biblical Research*, Vol. 6, No. 1 (London: Sheffield Academic Press, 2007).

## Studies LISTED CHRONOLOGICALLY

### **1965**

- Scholem, Gershom. *Jewish Gnosticism, Merkabah Mysticism, and Talmudic Tradition*. New York: The Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1960; 2<sup>nd</sup> improved edition, 1965.

The studies of Gershom Scholem form the basis of contemporary scholarship on Jewish mysticism, and, hence, provide the foundation of subsequent work on *merkabah* mysticism and *hekhalot* texts. Other works by Scholem address this subject at length:

- **1941** : *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism* (Hilda Strook Lectures, 1938, delivered at the Jewish Institute of Religion, New York). Jerusalem: Schocken Publishing House; rpt. London: Thames and Hudson, 1955; reprinted frequently: New York: Schocken Books.  
- LECTURE 2: “Merkabah Mysticism and Jewish Gnosticism”
- **1962** : *On the Mystical Shape of the Godhead: Basic Concepts in the Kabbalah*. New York: Schocken Books, 1991. The original version of this work was published in German, *Von der mystischen Gestalt der Gottheit: Studien zu Grundbegriffen d. Kabbala* (Zurich: Rhein-Verlag AG), and subsequently in a revised and emended Hebrew version, 1976.  
- CHAPTER 1. “*Shiur Komah*: The Mystical Shape of the Godhead”
- **1974** : *Kabbalah* [articles collected from *ENCYCLOPEDIA JUDAICA*]. Jerusalem and New York: Keter Publishing House and Times Books; rpt. New York: Meridian, 1978; rpt. New York, Dorset Press, 1987.  
- pages 8-21; pages 373-6: § MERKABAH MYSTICISM; pages 377-81: § METATRON

These works (*Major Trends...*, *Mystical Shape...*, and *Kabbalah*,) are given notice here not only to establish the starting point for “modern” scholarship on *hekhalot-merkabah* mysticism but to demonstrate Scholem’s development in appraising the subject.

### **1980**

- Gruenwald, Ithamar. *Apocalyptic and Merkavah Mysticism* [ARBEITEN ZUR GESCHICHTE DES ANTIKEN JUDENTUMS UND DES URCHRISTENTUMS, Band XIV]. Leiden – Köln: E. J. Brill, 1980. (hereafter AMM)

The first half of Gruenwald’s pioneering book analyzes the major features of the *merkabah* tradition, beginning in Jewish apocalyptic then developing into “the literature that first gives a full-scale presentation of Merkavah mysticism” i.e., the *hekhalot* literature, “composed in Eretz-Yisrael (circa 200-700),” thus ending “as a creative literary stream ... sometime in the Ge’onic period.”

The second half of AMM describes the *hekhalot* texts one by one, including *Re’yyot Yehezkel* and *Sefer ha-Razim*, items not generally considered part of the *hekhalot* corpus.

Two appendices by Saul Lieberman follow: (1) “Metatron, the Meaning of His Name and His Functions,” and (2) “The Knowledge of *Halakha* by the Author (or Authors) of the *Heikhaloth*.”

- Halperin, David J. *The Merkabah in Rabbinic Literature* [AMERICAN ORIENTAL SERIES, #62]. New Haven: American Oriental Society, 1980.

Halperin investigates the references to the *merkabah* tradition in Mishnah Hagigah 2:1, Tosefta Hagigah 2:1-7, Palestinian Talmud Hagigah 77a-d, and Babylonian Talmud Hagigah 11b-16a.

“I believe that I have shown that Scholem’s position is not securely supported by the rabbinic sources on the *merkabah*, which, taken by themselves, provide little reason to believe in the existence of the ‘*merkabah* mysticism’ envisioned by Scholem.” (– page 184)

## 1982

- Chernus, Ira. *Mysticism in Rabbinic Judaism: Studies in the History of Midrash* [STUDIA JUDAICA, Band XI]. Berlin – New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1982.

This series of essays shows the relationship between *merkabah* mysticism and rabbinic *midrashim* following, generally, two motifs: the revelation on Mount Sinai and the eschatological rewards of the world to come.

Refer also to Chernus’ articles:

- “Individual and Community in the Redaction of the Hekhalot Literature,” in *Hebrew Union College Annual* 52 (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College, 1981)
- “Visions of God in Merkabah Mysticism,” in *Journal for the Study of Judaism*, vol. 13, nos. 1-2 (1982)

## 1983

- Cohen, Martin Samuel. *The Shi’ur Qomah. Liturgy and Theurgy in Pre-Kabbalistic Jewish Mysticism*. Lanham: University Press of America, 1983.  
(See note below: 1985 • Cohen.)

## 1984

- Dan, Joseph. *Three Types of Ancient Jewish Mysticism* [SEVENTH ANNUAL RABBI LOUIS FEINBERG MEMORIAL LECTURE IN JUDAIC STUDIES]. Cincinnati: University of Cincinnati, 1984.

The “three types” discussed in this brief work are (i) ascent to the divine world, (ii) the mysticism of Hebrew letters, and (iii) *Sar Torah* (PRINCE OF THE TORAH) revelations. *Three Types...* is reprinted in Dan’s *Jewish Mysticism*, Volume I: LATE ANTIQUITY (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 1998).

## 1985

- Cohen, Martin Samuel. *The Shi’ur Qomah. Texts and Recensions* [TEXTE UND STUDIEN ZUM ANTIKEN JUDENTUM, Volume 9]. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, (Paul Siebeck), 1985

Cohen’s 1983 and 1985 works comprise an edited version of his PhD dissertation, THE ŠI’UR QOMAH: A CRITICAL EDITION OF THE TEXT WITH INTRODUCTION, TRANSLATION AND COMMENTARY (New York: The Jewish Theological Seminary, 1982).

See below, TRANSLATIONS & REFERENCES,” § F. *Shi’ur Qomah*.

## 1987

- Dan, Joseph (ed.) *Jerusalem Studies in Jewish Thought*, Volume VI, 1-2: PROCEEDINGS OF THE FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON THE HISTORY OF JEWISH MYSTICISM: *EARLY JEWISH MYSTICISM*. Jerusalem: The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 1987.  
This volume, both the Hebrew and English sections, is devoted to *hekhalot* literature and related topics. Articles in English include
  - Chernus, Ira. "The Pilgrimage to the Merkavah: An Interpretation of Early Jewish Mysticism"
  - Goldberg, Arnold. "Quotations from Scripture in Hekhalot Literature"
  - Grözinger, Karl Erich. "The Names of God and the Celestial Powers: Their Function and Meaning in the Hekhalot Literature"
  - Halperin, David J. "A Sexual Image in Hekhalot Rabbati and Its Implications"
  - Hayman, A. P. "Sefer Yesira and the Hekhalot Literature"
  - Schlüter, Margarete. "The Eulogy *Hakham ha-Razim va-Adon ha-Setarim* in Hekhalot Literature"
  - Van Uchelen, N. A. "Tosephtha Megillah III, 28: A Tanaitic Text with a Mystic Connotation?"

## 1988

- Gruenwald, Ithamar. *From Apocalypticism to Gnosticism: Studies in Apocalypticism, Merkavah Mysticism, and Gnosticism* [BEITRAGE ZUR ERFORSCHUNG DES ALTEN TESTAMENTS UND DES ANTIKEN JUDENTUMS, Band 14]. Frankfurt am Main: Verlag Peter Lang, 1988.

*From Apocalypticism...* is a collection of twelve articles (along with an introductory essay), most previously published. Four of the articles are new, and one appears in English for the first time.

## CONTENTS:

- Introductory Essay: The Cultural Milieu of Apocalypticism
- Chapter 1 Prophecy, Jewish Apocalyptic Literature and the Problem of the Uncanonical Books
- Chapter 2 Two Types of Jewish Esoteric Literature in the Time of the Mishnah and Talmud
- Chapter 3 Knowledge and Vision: Towards a Clarification of Two "Gnostic" Concepts in the Light of Their Alleged Origins
- Chapter 4 Priests, Prophets, Apocalyptic Visionaries, and Mystics
- Chapter 5 Angelic Songs, the Qedushah and the Problem of the Origin of Hekhalot Literature
- Chapter 6 Literary and Redactional Issues in the Study of the Hekhalot Literature
- Chapter 7 Jewish Merkavah Mysticism and Gnosticism
- Chapter 8 Jewish Sources for the Gnostic Texts from Nag Hammadi?
- Chapter 9 Aspects of the Jewish-Gnostic Controversy
- Chapter 10 The Problem of the Anti-Gnostic Polemic in Rabbinic Literature
- Chapter 11 Manichaeism and Judaism in Light of the Cologne Mani Codex
- Chapter 12 Halakhic Material in Codex Gnosticus V, 4: *The Second Apocalypse of James?*

Gruenwald comments,

The traditions and writings which are discussed in this collection of studies crystallized among people whose intellectual horizons were not as clearly and sharply outlined as those of the modern mind. For those people, the demarcation lines between dreams and dream-like situations, on the one hand, and rational wakefulness, on the other, were rather flexible and likely to be altogether ignored. (—PREFACE, page i)

Refer also to Gruenwald's article:

- "Reflections on the Nature and Origins of Jewish Mysticism," in *Gershom Scholem's MAJOR TRENDS IN JEWISH MYSTICISM 50 Years After*, edited by Joseph Dan and Peter Schäfer (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck] 1993)

- Halperin, David J. *The Faces of the Chariot: Early Jewish Responses to Ezekiel's Vision*. [TEXTE UND STUDIEN ZUM ANTIKEN JUDENTUM, Volume 16]. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1988. (hereafter FACES)

FACES is a thorough study which challenges many conclusions and assumptions of previous scholars, tracing *merkabah* material from the Bible, through the apocalypses and rabbinic literature, concluding with the *hekhalot* texts. Translations of the text *Re'iyot Yezekiel* (VISIONS OF EZEKIEL) and other important segments of *hekhalot* material are included.

FACES is valuable in a way that few books of this ilk are in that Halperin invites the reader to engage in his entire scholarly process, which he lays out in great detail in his 450-page text, two-tiered notes (footnotes and endnotes), seven informative appendices (Appendix I: “Orientation to Rabbinic Sources” is especially helpful), and full reference list (which is divided into sixteen sections according to topic).

Refer to Halperin’s articles:

- “Heavenly Ascension in Ancient Judaism: The Nature of the Experience,” in *Society of Biblical Literature 1987 Seminar Papers*, no. 26, edited by Harold Kent (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1987)
- “Ascension or Invasion: Implications of the Heavenly Journey in Ancient Judaism,” in *Religion*, vol. 18 (Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Oriel Press, 1988).

## 1989

- Janowitz, Naomi. *The Poetics of Ascent. Theories of Language in a Rabbinic Ascent Text* [SUNY SERIES IN JUDAICA: HERMENEUTICS, MYSTICISM, AND CULTURE]. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989.

*Poetics of Ascent* offers a translation of *Ma’aseh Merkabah* with a speculative analysis regarding the functions of this text’s “ritual language.”

Further, see Janowitz’ article

- “God’s Body: Theological and Ritual Roles of *Shi’ur Komah*,” in *People of the Body: Jews and Judaism from an Embodied Perspective*, edited by Howard Eilberg-Schwartz [SUNY SERIES: THE BODY IN CULTURE, HISTORY AND RELIGION]. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992.

## 1991

- Swartz, Michael D. *Mystical Prayer in Ancient Judaism. An Analysis of MA’ASEH MERKABAH* [TEXTE UND STUDIEN ZUM ANTIKEN JUDENTUM, Volume 28]. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1991.

*Mystical Prayer...* gives a full treatment and translation of *Ma’aseh Merkabah* (WORK OF THE CHARIOT).

*Mystical Prayer* is a revised and expanded version of Swartz’ PhD dissertation, LITURGICAL ELEMENTS IN EARLY JEWISH MYSTICISM: A Literary Analysis of “Ma’aseh Merkavah” (New York: New York University, 1986).

## 1992

- Dan, Joseph. *The Revelation of the Secret World: The Beginning of Jewish Mysticism*. Providence: Brown University Press, 1992.

After a discussion of the ironic errors of this lecture's title, Dan identifies the "distinctively mystical elements in *Hekhalot* literature" as residing in only five texts: *Hekhalot Rabbati*, *Hekhalot Zutarti*, *Sefer Hekhalot* (or 3 Enoch), *Ma'aseh Merkabah*, and *Shi'ur Qomah*.

*Revelation...* has been reprinted in Dan's *Jewish Mysticism*, Volume One: LATE ANTIQUITY (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 1998).

- Schäfer, Peter. *The Hidden and Manifest God: Some Major Themes in Early Jewish Mysticism* [SUNY SERIES IN JUDAICA: HERMENEUTICS, MYSTICISM, AND RELIGION]. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992. (hereafter HMG)

HMG is a detailed look at a selection of *hekhalot* texts. Instead of summarizing each text in turn, Schäfer organizes his analysis thematically, considering each text's notion of God, angels, and man. He clarifies the roles of two distinct motifs: (i) ascent through the *hekhalot* to the throne of glory, and (ii) the adjuration—either to God or to one of his angels.

Refer to Schäfer's articles:

- "Tradition and Redaction in Hekhalot Literature," in *Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic, and Roman Period*, vol. 14, no. 2 (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1983); reprinted in Schäfer's *Hekhalot-Studien* (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1988).
- "New Testament and Hekhalot Literature: The Journey into Heaven in Paul and in Merkavah Mysticism," in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 35, no. 1 (The Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies, Spring 1984); reprinted in Schäfer's *Hekhalot-Studien*.
- "Research on Hekhalot Literature: Where Do We Stand Now?" in *Rashi 1040—1990: Congrès européen des Études juives* [HOMMAGE A EPHRAIM E. URBACH], edited by Gabrielle Sed-Rajna (Paris: Les éditions du Cerf, 1993).

## 1993

- Dan, Joseph. *The Ancient Jewish Mysticism*. Tel Aviv: MOD [= Ministry of Defense] Books, 1993.

Dan reviews all of the major topics, issues, and texts in a manner which does not exclude the non-specialist. *Ancient Jewish Mysticism* expands Dan's earlier chap book, *Three Types of Ancient Jewish Mysticism* (University of Cincinnati, 1984)—see above **1984** • Dan.

Further elaborating on the topics covered in *The Ancient Jewish Mysticism* is the collection of articles which comprises Dan's *Jewish Mysticism*, Volume One: LATE ANTIQUITY (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 1998; hereafter JM1), in which the articles by Dan listed below have been reprinted.

- "The Concept of History in Hekhalot and Merkabah Literature," in *Binah: Studies in Jewish History, Thought, and Culture*, vol. 1: STUDIES IN JEWISH HISTORY, edited by Joseph Dan (New York – Westport: Praeger Publishers, 1989) = JM1: CHAPTER 7.
- "The Concept of Knowledge in the *Shi'ur Qomah*," in *Studies in Jewish Religious and Intellectual History* [PRESENTED TO ALEXANDER ALTMANN ON THE OCCASION OF HIS SEVENTIETH BIRTHDAY], edited by Siegfried Stein and Raphael Loewe (University of Alabama Press/Institute of Jewish Studies: 1979) = JM1: CHAPTER 8.
- "Rashi and the Merkabah," in *Rashi 1040—1990: Congrès européen des Études juives* [HOMMAGE A EPHRAIM E. URBACH], edited by Gabrielle Sed-Rajna (Paris: Les éditions du Cerf, 1993) = JM1: CHAPTER 11.

1994

- Wolfson, Elliot R. *Through a Speculum That Shines: Vision and Imagination in Medieval Jewish Mysticism* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994) (hereafter SPECULUM)

“This book … is an attempt to treat in a comprehensive manner the problem of visionary experience in some of the main texts of the classical period of medieval Jewish mysticism. I have isolated the problem of vision and visualization since this constitutes one of the essential phenomenological concerns in the various mystical corpora produced by Jewish authors throughout history. I make no claim that mysticism is identical to or collapsible into the phenomenon of vision. I do, however, maintain that the examination of this issue provides an excellent speculum through which to view the religious experience of different Jewish mystics.

While the major focus of this book, from a chronological perspective, is the High Middle Ages…(chapters 5 to 7), in chapter 3 I discuss the nature of the vision of the glory in the ancient Jewish mystical corpus known as the *Hekhalot* or *Merkavah* literature. The justification for including this chapter is both historical-textual and phenomenological.” (—page 9) [my ellipses—DK]

After providing a summary of scholarship on *hekhalot* literature, CHAPTER 3, “Visionary Ascent and Enthronement in the *Hekhalot* Literature,” discusses the vision of God as presented therein, citing *Hekhalot Rabbati* most often. Wolfson explores problematic aspects—“The Paradox of Seeing the Hidden God,” eroticism, anthropomorphism—which bear upon the import of the texts: Did actual experiences determine the texts, or did the texts determine the experiences? Are the experiences themselves “real” or “imagined”? Does the *hekhalot* literature represent experience or exegesis? Are such distinctions useful in understanding the intent of the *hekhalot* authors? Through the chapter, Wolfson remains in dialogue with other scholars who have treated the *hekhalot* material—Scholem, Schäfer, and Halperin in particular.

“From a phenomenological perspective as well, it is obvious that the *Hekhalot* corpus is an intrinsic part of such a study [i.e., of visionary experience in medieval Jewish mysticism], insofar as the vision of glory and the chariot served as a paradigm for visionary experience in later Jewish mysticism, influenced in particular…by the philosophical reinterpretations of this religious experience, as will be discussed in chapter 4 [“Theories of Glory and Visionary Experience in Pre-Kabbalistic Sources”]. To be sure, in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries the various ‘trends’ of Jewish mysticism took shape in such a way that the chariot vision is hermeneutically transformed. It is nevertheless the case that the major mystical ideologies of the period to be discussed in this monograph, the German Pietists [CHAPTER 5: “Haside Ashakenaz: Verdical and Docetic [≈ “real” or “imagined”] Interpretations of the Chariot Vision”] and the Provençal-Spanish kabbalists of the theosophic trend [CHAPTERS 6 and 7, “Visionary Gnosis and the Role of the Imagination in Theosophic Kabbalah” and “The Hermeneutics of Visionary Experience: Revelation and Interpretation in the *Zohar*”] orient themselves in terms of the chariot. In that sense we can speak of these schools as hermeneutical transformations of the *Hekhalot* mysticism.” (—pages 9-10) [my brackets and ellipses—DK]

Further, refer to Wolfson’s articles

- “The Image of Jacob Engraved upon the Throne: Further Reflection on the Esoteric Doctrine of the German Pietists” = CHAPTER 1 of *Along the Path: Studies in Kabbalistic Myth, Symbolism, and Hermeneutics* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995).

- “Jewish Mysticism: A Philosophical Overview,” § MERKAVAH MYSTICISM, in *History of Jewish Philosophy* [ROUTLEDGE HISTORY OF WORLD PHILOSOPHIES – volume 2], edited by Daniel H. Frank & Oliver Leaman (London – New York: Routledge, 1997)
- “Metatron and Shi’ur Qomah in the Writings of the Haside Ashkenaz,” in *Mysticism, Magic and Kabbalah in Ashkenazi Judaism: International Symposium held in Frankfurt a. M. 1991*, edited by Karl Erich Grözinger and Joseph Dan [STUDIA JUDAICA: Band XIII] (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1995).
- “*Yeridah la-Merkavah*: Typology of Ecstasy and Enthronement in Ancient Jewish Mysticism,” in *Mystics of the Book: Themes, Topics, and Typologies*, edited by R. A. Herrera (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, Inc., 1993).

### 1995

- Deutsch, Nathaniel. *The Gnostic Imagination. Gnosticism, Mandaeism, and Merkabah Mysticism* [BRILL’S SERIES ON JEWISH STUDIES, 13]. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995.

Deutsch gives an account of the relationship between Gnosticism and *merkabah* mysticism using Scholem’s written statements on these as a starting point. He surveys a range of scholarly opinion on issues surrounding these topics, drawing on many of the writers mentioned in this bibliography. Deutsch summarizes his view of Scholem on page 36: “Even though his [Scholem’s] comparative analysis of Gnosticism and Merkabah mysticism is problematic from a number of methodological perspectives, its role as an intellectual catalyst cannot be overstated.”

- Fossum, Jarl E. *The Image of the Invisible God: Essays on the Influence of Jewish Mysticism on Early Christology* [NOVUM TESTAMENTUM ET ORBIS ANTIQUUS 30] Freiburg, Schweiz: Universitätsverlag / Göttingen: Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht, 1995.

“Many statements about Jesus in the Gospel according to John can be paralleled by what is said about Metatron in 3 Enoch and the Son in Valentinian Gnosticism. Perhaps the most striking similarity is that they all are represented as the possessor of the Name of God, the concept of which plays an enormous role in Judaism. As the figure of Metatron appears to be some sort of systemization of and elaboration upon everything that was said about the principal angel in older sources, works outdated even John, it would seem that both Johannine and Gnostic Christology owe to mystical Judaism.” (INTRODUCTION, pages 3-4)

- Kuyt, Annalies. *The ‘Descent’ to the Chariot. Towards a Description of the Terminology, Place, Function and Nature of the YERIDAH in Hekhalot Literature* [TEXTE UND STUDIEN ZUM ANTIKEN JUDENTUM, Volume 45]. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1995. (hereafter DESCENT)

DESCENT offers a discussion of the heavenly journey, *yeridah*, literally “descent,” to the *merkabah* in various passages of the *hekhalot* literature. Kuyt outlines the contents of *Hekhalot Rabbati*, *Hekhalot Zutreti*, *Ma’aseh Merkabah*, *Merkabah Rabbah*, 3 Enoch, and one of the Genizah fragments. Translated excerpts from all these texts are included.

### 1996

- DeConick, April D. *Seek to See Him: Ascent and Vision Mysticism in the Gospel of Thomas* [Supplement to VIGILLE CHRISTIANÆ, 33]. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996.

“This monograph represents a critical juncture in Thomas studies since it dispels the belief that the Gospel of Thomas originates from gnostic traditions. Rather, Jewish mystical and Hermetic origins are proposed and examined.” (—ENDFLAP)

- Swartz, Michael D. *Scholastic Magic. Ritual and Revelation in Early Jewish Mysticism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996.

Swartz translates and analyzes the *Sar Torah* (PRINCE OF THE TORAH) texts with an eye toward the cultural environment which produced them.

#### 1997

- Green, Arthur. *Keter: The Crown of God in Early Jewish Mysticism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997.

In chapters 4 through 7, passages from *Shi'ur Qomah*, 3 Enoch, *Razo shel Sandalphon* (SECRET OF SANDALPHON, a *hekhalot*-related text), and *Hekhalot Rabbati* are translated and analyzed.

#### 1998

- Kanagaraj, Jey J. *Mysticism in the Gospel of John: An Inquiry into Its Background* [JOURNAL FOR THE STUDY OF THE NEW TESTAMENT, Sup. 158]. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1998.

The first half of the book (Parts 1 and 2) provides an excellent survey of *merkabah* material and the literature (apocalyptic, non-apocalyptic—including Qumran material—and Christian) clustered around it from Hellenistic times through the first century. Part 2 examines *merkabah* mysticism in some detail to set up an analysis of its connections with Johannine mysticism.

- Kraemer, Ross Shepard. *When Aseneth Met Joseph: A Late Antique Tale of the Biblical Patriarch and His Egyptian Wife, Reconsidered*. New York – Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

“...*Aseneth* displays significant affinities with traditions about the adjuration of angels and ‘ascent’ to heavens as known to us from the problematic *hekhalot* and related materials. ... Given the nature of our sources, it seems impossible to know what if any actual connections might exist between *Aseneth* and *hekhalot* traditions. But if the longer version of *Aseneth* in particular does stand in some self-conscious relationship to the *hekhalot* traditions, gender may well be a significant factor in the differences.”  
—*When Aseneth Met Joseph*, page 173)

Refer especially to CHAPTER 4, “*Aseneth* and the Adjuration of Angels,” and CHAPTER 5, “*Aseneth* and Mystical Transformation in the *Hekhalot* Traditions.”

Further, see Celia Deutsch, “Aseneth: Ascetical Practice, Vision, and Transformation; in *With Letters of Light: Studies in the Dead Sea Scrolls, Early Jewish Apocalypticism, Magic, and Mysticism in Honor of Rachel Elior* [EKSTASIS: RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE FROM ANTIQUITY TO THE MIDDLE AGES, vol. 2], edited by Daphna V. Arbel and Andrei A. Orlov (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co., 2011).

- Lesses, Rebecca Macy. *Ritual Practices to Gain Power: Angels, Incantations, and Revelation in Early Jewish Mysticism* [HARVARD THEOLOGICAL STUDIES 44]. Harrisburg: Trinity Press International, 1998. (hereafter *Ritual Practices*)

Lesses concentrates on the adjuration sections of the *hekhalot* material. Along with an analysis of these “ritual performances,” Lesses presents a survey of current scholarship (covering many of the authors mentioned in the present paper). Further, she attempts to set the adjurations of the *hekhalot* into the milieu of the Greco-Egyptian ritual literature of late antiquity.

## Refer to Lesses' articles

- “The Adjuration of the Prince of the Presence: Performative Utterance in a Jewish Ritual,” in *Ancient Magic and Ritual Power*, edited by Marvin Meyer and Paul Mirecki [RELIGIONS IN THE GRECO-ROMAN WORLD, 129] (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995).
- “He Shall Not Look at a Woman?: Gender in the Hekhalot Literature,” in *Mapping Gender in Ancient Religious Discourses*, edited by Todd Penner and Caroline Vander Stichele (Leiden: Brill, 2006).
- “Amulets and Angels: Visionary Experience in the *Testament of Job* and the Hekhalot Literature,” in *Heavenly Tablets: Interpretation, Identity and Tradition in Ancient Judaism*, edited by Lynn R. LiDonnici and Andrea Lieber (Leiden: Brill, 2007).

## 1999

- Deutsch, Nathaniel. *Guardians of the Gate: Angelic Vice Regency in Late Antiquity* [BRILL'S SERIES IN JEWISH STUDIES, 22]. Leiden: Brill, 1999.

“Within Merkabah mysticism, God is frequently depicted as an exalted and highly remote figure. Thus, Scholem was partly right when he described the gulf between humans and the God in Merkabah mysticism. Yet, Scholem erred when he emphasized the impossibility of closing this gulf—that is, when he defined the God of Merkabah mysticism as absolutely inaccessible or transcendent. How was the distance between human beings and God breached in Merkabah mysticism? The answer to this question requires an appreciation of the paradoxical nature of the angelic vice regent.”  
 (—*Guardians of the Gate*, p. 9).

Deutsch discusses Metatron in this role, with comments on Akatriel. He then examines similar figures in Gnosticism (Sabaoth) and Mandaeism (Abathur).

Further, refer to Deutsch's article:

- “Dangerous Ascents: Rabbi Akiba’s Water Warning and Late Antique Cosmological Traditions,” in *The Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, vol. 8 (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1998)
- Hannah, Darrell D. *Michael and Christ: Michael Traditions and Angel Christology* [WISSENSCHAFTLICHE UNTERSUCHUNGEN ZUM NEUEN TESTAMENT: REIHE 2: 109]. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1999.

See in particular CHAPTER 5, “The Archangel Michael in Rabbinic and Hekhalot Literature.” This chapter’s PART 2, § c. develops “The Michael-Metatron Identification” (pages 119-121).

## 2000

- Kanarfogel, Ephraim. *“Peering through the Lattices”: Mystical, Magical, and Pietistic Dimensions in the Tosafist Period*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2000.

Kanarfogel tracks the influence and use of *hekhalot* and other mystical and magical material to 12<sup>th</sup>- and 13<sup>th</sup>-century Germany and France. He argues that esoteric teachings and practices spread beyond the *Hasidei Ashkenaz* to the *tosafists*, rabbinic descendants of Rashi, conventionally considered to have been inclined exclusively toward study of the Talmud.

**2001**

- Davila, James R. *Descenders to the Chariot: The People behind the Hekhalot Literature* [SUPPLEMENT TO THE JOURNAL FOR THE STUDY OF JUDAISM, Volume 70]. Leiden – Boston – Köln: Brill, 2001.

In the first chapter, Davila provides an excellent summary of the issues and debates in *hekhalot* scholarship. He then makes his case for understanding the *hekhalot* texts not as being mere literary constructs but as describing the experiences of real practitioners, whom Davila likens to shamans, *i.e.*, “religious functionaries,” “intermediaries” seeking “to gain power over the spiritual world.”

Further, see Davila’s articles

- “Prolegomena to a Critical Edition of the Hekhalot Rabbati,” in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 45, no. 2 (The Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies, 1994).
- “Shamanic Initiatory Death and Resurrection in the *Hekhalot* Literature,” in *Magic and Ritual in the Ancient World*, part 4, edited by Paul Allan Mirecki and Marvin W. Meyer (Leiden – Boston – Köln: Brill, 2001)
- Eskola, Timo. *Messiah and the Throne: Jewish Merkabah Mysticism and Early Christian Exaltation Discourse* [WISSENSCHAFTLICHE UNTERSUCHUNGEN ZUM NEUEN TESTAMENT 2. Reihe 142]. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2001.

Eskola says in the introduction (page 17), “...it will be the main purpose of this work to investigate the relationship between Jewish merkabah mysticism and New Testament exaltation Christology by focusing on the central metaphor of the throne. In this study our interest lies in the occupants of the throne, in enthronements, and in the function of the throne in different contexts.”

**2002**

- Janowitz, Naomi. *Icons of Power: Ritual Practices in Late Antiquity* [MAGIC IN HISTORY]. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2002.

Chapter 5, “Using Names, Letters, and Praise: The Language of Ascent,” focuses on *Hekhalot Rabbati*. Chapter 6, “Combining Words and Deeds: Angelic Imprecations in *The Book of Secrets*,” discusses *Sefer ha-Razim*. The *hekhalot* practitioners are considered within the broader setting of the prevailing assumptions—Jewish, Christian, and pagan—of the culture in Late Antiquity concerning religion and ritual.

- Morray-Jones, C. R. A. *A Transparent Illusion. The Dangerous Vision of Water in Hekhalot Mysticism: A Source-Critical and Tradition-Historical Inquiry* [Supplements to the JOURNAL FOR THE STUDY OF JUDAISM, volume 59]. Leiden – Boston – Köln: Brill, 2002.

In the first section of *A Transparent Illusion*, Morray-Jones builds upon (and occasionally corrects) comments regarding the “water test” passages in his own earlier two-part article, “Paradise Revisited (2 Cor 12:1-12): The Jewish Mystical background of Paul’s Apostolate, Part 1: The Jewish Sources” and “Part 2: Paul’s Heavenly Ascent and Its Significance (both in *Harvard Theological Review* 86, Cambridge: 1993). Thereafter, Morray-Jones offers an in-depth analysis of the “water vision episode” within the context of the *hekhalot* literature, *i.e.*, *Hekhalot Rabbati* and, especially, *Hekhalot Zutarti*. An extensive appendix discusses “Solomon and the Queen of Sheba,” a story which “appears to derive from the same traditional

background and to be related in some manner to the water vision episode itself' (—page 230).

Refer to Morray-Jones' articles

- "Hekhalot Literature and Talmudic Tradition: Alexander's Three Test Cases," in *Journal for the Study of Judaism*, vol. 22, no.1 (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1991)
- "Transformational Mysticism in the Apocalyptic-Merkabah Tradition," in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 43, no. 1 (The Oxford Centre for the Hebrew and Jewish Studies, 1992)

## 2003

- Arbel, Vita Daphna. *Beholders of Divine Secrets: Mysticism and Myth in the Hekhalot and Merkavah Literature*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2003.

Arbel's summary of *hekhalot* and *merkabah* literature and scholarly approaches to it is not as engaging or detailed as, for instance, the introduction in Davila's *Descenders to the Chariot* (see above). However, Arbel nicely treats the question, "What is MYSTICAL about *hekhalot-merkabah* mysticism?" *i.e.*, what are its "mystical" characteristics and intentions?

FROM THE SUNY PRESS CATALOGUE (Spring 2003): "While previous scholarship has demonstrated the connection between Hekhalot and Merkavah mysticism and parallel traditions in Rabbinical writings, the Dead Sea Scrolls, apocalyptic, early Christian, and Gnostic sources, this work points out additional mythological traditions that resonate in this literature. Arbel suggests that mythological patterns of expression, as well as themes and models rooted in Near Eastern mythological traditions are employed, in spiritualized fashion, to communicate mystical content."

See also Arbel's articles

- "'Understanding of the Heart.' Spiritual Transformation and Divine Revelations in the Hekhalot and Merkavah Literature," in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, Volume 6, No. 4 (1999). Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr.
- "Pure Marble Stones or Water? On Ecstatic Perception, Group Identity, and Authority in Hekhalot and Merkavah Literature," in *Studies in Spirituality*, Volume 16 (2006). Kampen [Netherlands]: Kok Pharos.

## 2004

- Elior, Rachel. *The Three Temples: On the Emergence of Jewish Mysticism*, translated by David Louvish [= MIKDASH U-MERKAVAH, KOHANIM U-MAL'AKHIM, HEKHAL BA-MISTIKAH HA YEHIDIT HA-KEDUMAH, 2002]. Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2004.

Elior details the traditions and literature leading up to the *hekhalot* texts. She writes,

Heikhalot literature preserves the living continuation of the sacred service by recovering it from the realm of space and time: the Temple/*hekhal* is lifted up to the heavens, and the priests serving therein become the ministering angels in the supernal Temples; the sacred service in these heavenly sanctuaries is described explicitly in terms of the rituals of the earthly Temple. This metamorphosis is implemented through the terminology of Merkavah mysticism, combining the hallowed memory of ritual with creative imagination and visionary inspiration, creating a bridge between the 'revealed' and the 'hidden.'

(—INTRODUCTION, pages 14-15).

Elior attempts to show that *merkabah/hekhalot* mysticism grew out of practices described in the writings of the Qumran sect.

Refer, however, to the critical comments made about Elior's *Three Temples* by presenters Nehemia Polen, Alan F. Segal, Jonah Steinberg, and Lawrence H. Schiffman at the 36<sup>th</sup> Annual Conference of the Association for Jewish Studies (Chicago: December 19-21, 2004), § 4.5, HEAVENLY SECRETS AND HUMAN AUTHORITY IN THE THOUGHT OF SECTARIANS, SAGES, AND EARLY JEWISH MYSTICS, Chair: Rebecca Lesses (CDs and tapes available from Content Management Corporation, 3043 Foothill Blvd., Suite #2, La Crescenta, CA 91214: 818-857-0874). Find also the "devastating critique of most of [Elior's] major theses" (— quoting Peter Schäfer, *The Origins of Jewish Mysticism*, p. 14, n. 51) by Martha Himmelfarb in "Merkavah Mysticism since Scholem: Rachel Elior's *The Three Temples*," in *Wege Mystischer Gotteserfahrung: Judentum, Christentum und Islam / Mystical Approaches to God: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam*, edited by Peter Schäfer (Munich: Oldenbourg, 2006). Ironically, Elior reiterates arguments from *The Three Temples* in a paper which appears immediately before Himmelfarb's in the same volume (see the list of Elior's articles immediately below).

In Elior's defense, see Joseph Dan's review, "Varieties of Religious Experience," at HAARETZ.COM (<http://www.haaretz.com/culture/books/varieties-of-religious-experiences-1.11180>).

Also, see Elior's articles

- "The Concept of God in Merkabah Mysticism," in *Binah: Studies in Jewish History, Thought, and Culture*, vol. 2: STUDIES IN JEWISH THOUGHT, edited by Joseph Dan (New York – Westport: Praeger Publishers, 1989) (= a translation from the Hebrew of Elior's article in *Jerusalem Studies in Jewish Thought*, vol. 6, nos. 1-2, edited by Joseph Dan (Jerusalem: Hebrew University, 1987).
- "Mysticism, Magic, and Angelology: The Perception of Angels in Hekhalot Literature," in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, vol. 1, no. 1 (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck] 1993).
- "From Earthly Temple to Heavenly Shrines: Prayer and Sacred Song in the Hekhalot Literature and Its Relation to Tradition," in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, vol. 4, no. 3 (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1997).
- "The Merkavah Tradition and the Emergence of Jewish Mysticism: From Temple to Merkavah, from Hekhal to Hekhalot, from Priestly Opposition to Gazing upon the Merkavah," in *Sino-Judaica, Jews and Chinese in Historical Dialogue*, edited by A. Oppenheimer (Tel Aviv: Tel Aviv University Press 1999).
- "The Priestly Nature of the Mystical Heritage in *Heykalot Literature*," in *Experience et Écriture Mystiques dans les Religions du Livre*, edited by Paul Fenton and Roland Goetschel [ETUDES SUR LE JUDAISME MEDIEVAL, TOME XXII] Leiden: Brill, 2000.
- "The Foundations of Early Jewish Mysticism: The Lost Calendar and the Transformed Heavenly Chariot," in *Wege Mystischer Gotteserfahrung: Judentum, Christentum und Islam / Mystical Approaches to God: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam*, edited by Peter Schäfer (Munich: Oldenbourg, 2006)

## 2005

- Boustany, Ra'anan. *From Martyr to Mystic: Rabbinic Martyrology and the Making of Merkavah Mysticism*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005. (≈ Abusch, Ra'anan S. FROM MARTYR TO MYSTIC: THE STORY OF THE TEN MARTYRS, HEKHALOT RABBATI, AND THE MAKING OF "MERKAVAH MYSTICISM." Ph.D. dissertation, Princeton: Princeton University, 2004)

'My emphasis on the situated nature of "Merkavah mysticism" [as opposed to a "radical alternative or esoteric counterpart of 'normative' rabbinic Judaism"] represents, at least in part, a reaction to the scholarly literature that stems from this homogenizing tendency [which is to "routinely conflate later applications or elaborations on Heikalot texts with the

Jewish ‘mystical’ or ‘magical’ literatures of Late Antiquity”]. To this end, this study aims to illuminate the particular historical circumstances and ideological motivations that led the creators of *Hekhalot Rabbati* to formulate their novel conception of heavenly ascent as an esoteric ritual discipline. I thereby pointedly emphasize the role of Heikhalot literature in the transformation of Jewish religious thought from its largely decentralized roots in Late Antiquity to its gradual drive towards systematization in the High Middle Ages.<sup>7</sup>  
 (— PREFACE, pages viii-ix)

- Orlov, Andrei A. *The Enoch-Metatron Tradition* [TEXTS AND STUDIES IN ANCIENT JUDAISM 107]. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005.

PART ONE, “Evolution of the Roles and Titles of the Seventh Antediluvian Hero in Mesopotamian, Enochic, and Merkabah Tradition” [Chapter Three deals primarily with *Sefer Hekhalot* (3 ENOCH)]

PART TWO, “Polemical (Adamic, Mosaic, and Noachic) Developments and Their Role in the Evolution of Enoch’s Roles and Titles in the Slavonic Apocalypse (= 2 ENOCH)”

Orlov fills a gap in scholarship by reintroducing the Slavonic pseudepigrapha (THE APOCALYPSE OF ABRAHAM, THE LADDER OF JACOB, and, particularly, 2 ENOCH) into the progression from Second Temple apocalypticism to *hekhalot* literature (which progression, borrowing from Hugo Odeberg’s analysis, can be epitomized as 1 ENOCH → 2 ENOCH → 3 ENOCH). Orlov refers to 2 ENOCH as “proto-*hekhalot*,” which indicates, in Orlov’s assessment, the degree to which rabbinic mystical and *hekhalot* literature relied upon it.

## 2006

- Alexander, Philip. *The Mystical Texts: Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice and Related Manuscripts* [COMPANION TO THE QUMRAN SCROLLS, 7 / LIBRARY OF SECOND TEMPLE STUDIES, 61]. London – New York: T&T Clark International, 2006.

Alexander treats “Heikhalot Mysticism and Qumran” in CHAPTER 5, stating,

...comparison of Qumran mysticism with Heikhalot mysticism draws Qumran into the larger discipline of the study of Jewish mysticism, and puts it in a broader intellectual context. It is probably not unfair to say that the study of the Scrolls has been somewhat marginalized within the study of Judaism, and its significance underestimated by mainline Jewish Studies scholars (see Schiffman 1994 [*Reclaiming the Dead Sea Scrolls*—noted immediately below]). ... It is only recently that attempts have been made to integrate the Qumran evidence into the general history of Jewish mysticism (e.g., Elior 2004 [*The Three Temples*—noted above]). As we shall see, this evidence arguably challenges Scholem’s paradigm of Jewish mysticism [as in *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*—noted above], and forces a revision of it.... (—pages 121-2)

Regarding the *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice* and other “mystical” texts from Qumran, see

- Abusch, Ra’anan. “Seven-fold Hymns in the *Sabbath Sacrifice* and the Hekhalot Literature: Formalism, Hierarchy, and the Limits of Human Participation,” in *The Dead Sea Scrolls as Background to Post-Biblical Judaism and Early Christianity*, edited by James R. Davila [STDJ 46] (Leiden: Brill, 2003).
- Boustan, Ra’anan S. “Angels in the Architecture: Temple Art and the Poetics of Praise in the *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice*,” in *Heavenly Realms and Earthly Realities in Late Antique Religions*, edited by Ra’anan S. Boustan and Annette Yoshiko Reed (Cambridge – New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004).

- Charlesworth, James H., and Cross, Frank Moore (eds). *The Dead Sea Scrolls: Angelic Liturgy: Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice* (Hebrew, Aramaic, and Greek Texts with English Translations). Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck) – Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1994.
  - Davila, James R. *Liturgical Works* [EERDMAN'S COMMENTARIES ON THE DEAD SEA SCROLLS, 6]. Grand Rapids – Cambridge: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2000: §§"4QBerakhot (4Q286-90, 4Q280?)" AND "Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice (4Q400-407, 11Q17, Mas1K)"—pages 41-167. Through Davila's translations, parallels to *hekhalot* texts are cited and discussed in brief.
  - \_\_\_\_\_. "The Dead Sea Scrolls and Merkavah Mysticism," in *The Dead Sea Scrolls in their Historical Context*, edited by Timothy H. Lim with Larry W. Hurtado, A. Graeme Auld and Alison Jack (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 2000), pp. 249-264.
  - Fletcher-Lewis, Crispin H. T. "Heavenly Ascent and Incarnational Presence: A Revisionist Reading of the *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice*," in *Society of Biblical Literature 1998 Seminar Papers* (SBLSP 37 – Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1998), and listed at the website JEWISH ROOTS OF EASTERN CHRISTIAN MYSTICISM (<http://www.marquette.edu/maqom/>)
  - Newsom, Carol A. "Merkabah Exegesis in the Qumran *Sabbath Shirot*," in *Journal of Jewish Studies* 38:1 (Cambridge: 1987)
  - \_\_\_\_\_. *Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice: A Critical Edition* [HARVARD SEMITIC STUDIES 27]. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1985 (which is a revised version of Newsom's Ph.D. dissertation, 4Q SEREK SIROT 'OLAT: EDITION, TRANSLATION, AND COMMENTARY. Cambridge: Harvard University, 1982); see especially Chapter VII. "4Q Sir and the Tradition of the Hekhalot Hymns".
  - Schiffman, Lawrence. "Merkavah Speculation at Qumran: The 4Q *Serekh Shirot 'Olat ha-Shabbat*," in *Mystics, Philosophers, and Politicians*, edited by J. Reinhartz and D. Swetschinski (Durham: Duke University Press, 1982).
  - \_\_\_\_\_. *Reclaiming the Dead Sea Scrolls: The History of Judaism, the Background of Christianity, the Lost Library of Qumran*. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1994: Chapter 22, "Mysticism and Magic."
  - Schäfer, Peter. "Communion with the Angels: Qumran and the Origins of Jewish Mysticism," in *Weg e Mytischer Gotteserfahrung: Judentum, Christentum und Islam / Mystical Approaches to God: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam*, edited by Peter Schäfer (Munich: Oldenbourg, 2006).
  - Swartz, Michael D. "The Dead Sea Scrolls and Later Jewish Magic and Mysticism," in *Dead Sea Discoveries* 8 (Leiden – New York: E. J. Brill, 2001), pp. 182-193.
  - Gooder, Paula R. *Only the Third Heaven? 2 Corinthians 12:1-10 and Heavenly Ascent*. London – New York: T & T Clark, 2006.
 

In an effort to determine the relationship of Paul's ascent in 2 Cor. 12 to other early ascent accounts, a range of texts is considered, including 4QBerakhot and the Slavonic Enoch. *Hekhalot* literature, primarily *Sefer Hekhalot* (3 ENOCH), is discussed in CHAPTER 8.

Note Christopher R. A. Morray-Jones' objections to Gooder in *The Mystery of God*, pages 402-404 (listed below: 2009• Rowland/Morray-Jones).
  - *Paradise Now: Essays on Early Jewish and Christian Mysticism*, edited by April D. DeConick. Leiden – Boston: Brill / Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2006. (hereafter *Paradise Now*)
- These eighteen articles, gathered from symposia of the Early Jewish and Christian Mysticism unit of the Society of Biblical Literature conducted over a ten-year span commencing in 1995, are described in DeConick's preface as "a pioneering volume, the first ever to collect international voices that are mapping this field of study" (page xx).

## CONTENTS:

Abbreviations

## PREFACE

## PART 1: HERMENEUTICS AND EXPERIENCE

- Alan F. Segal, “Religious Experience and the Construction of the Transcendent Self”
- Christopher Rowland, with Patricia Gibbons and Vicente Dobroruka, “Visionary Experience in Ancient Judaism and Christianity”
- Seth L. Sanders, “Performative Exegesis”

## PART 2: COMMUNAL IDENTITIES

- Rachel Elior, “The Emergence of the Mystical Traditions of the *Merkabah*”
- James R. Davila, “The Ancient Jewish Apocalypses and the *Hekhalot* Literature”
- Ra’anan S. Boustan, “Rabbi Ishmael’s Priestly Genealogy in *Hekhalot* Literature”

## PART 3: COSMOLOGY

- Christopher R. A. Morray-Jones, “The Temple Within”
- Andrei A. Orlov, “God’s Face in the Enochic Tradition”
- Cameron C. Afzal, “Wheels of Time in the Apocalypse of Jesus Christ”
- Kevin Sullivan, “Sexuality and Gender of Angels”

## PART 4: APOCALYPTICISM

- Frances Flannery-Dailey, “Lessons on Early Jewish Apocalypticism and Mysticism from Dream Literature”
- Kelley Coblenz Bautch, “Situating the Afterlife”

## PART 5: PRACTICES

- Celia Deutsch, “The Therapeuta, Text Work, Ritual, and Mystical Experience”
- Andrea Lieber, “Jewish and Christian Heavenly Meal Traditions”
- Charles A. Gieschen, “Baptismal Praxis and Mystical Experience in the Book of Revelation”
- Daphna Arbel, “Divine Secrets and Divination”

## Bibliography

## Contributors

## Indices

- Smith, Ian K. *Heavenly Perspective: A Study of the Apostle Paul’s Response to a Jewish Mystical Movement at Colossae* [A CONTINUUM IMPRINT]. London – New York: T & T Clark International, 2006.

Smith’s CHAPTER 3, “Jewish Mysticism,” concentrates on the early development of *merkabah* mysticism in the pseudepigrapha, Philo, Qumran literature, and Revelation. From his research on the first-century ascent material, Smith concludes that Paul’s letter to the Colossians is a response to the “super-spirituality” of ascent practitioners, for “such practices showed a faith that was more dependent on human effort than divine grace, and was thereby a denial of Paul’s gospel.” (—page 73)

## 2007

- Bloom, Maureen. *Jewish Mysticism and Magic: An Anthropological Perspective* [ROUTLEDGE JEWISH STUDIES SERIES] (London – New York: Routledge, 2007).

*Merkabah/hekhalot* and related literature are taken up in CHAPTER 10, “Approximating God, Appropriating Authority: *Hekhalot* and *Merkavah* literature,” and CHAPTER 11, “Imprecations, Healing, and Protection: The ‘Book of Secrets’, amulets, incantation bowls.”

- Halbertal, Moshe. *Concealment and Revelation: Esotericism in Jewish Thought and Its Philosophical Implications*, translated by Jackie Feldman. Princeton – Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2007.

CHAPTER 3 “The Ethics of Gazing: The Attitude of Early Jewish Mysticism toward Seeing the Chariot; and CHAPTER 4 “Concealment and Power: Magic and Esotericism in the Hekhalot Literature.”

Toward the end of CHAPTER 4, Halbertal writes,

The fundamental unit for the transmission of esoteric oral knowledge is the family. According to the testimony of Rabbi Eleazar of Worms, the termination of his family line, as a result of the early death of his son and combined with the diminution of his students, moved him to commit the secrets of the Torah to writing. The fear of the loss of the secret as a result of the diminution of the line of transmission justified the writing down of the secret; thus, the knowledge could be passed on without relying on the continuous chain of oral tradition. (—page 33)

- Orlov, Andrei A. *From Apocalypticism to Merkabah Mysticism: Studies in Slavonic Pseudepigrapha*. [Supplements to THE JOURNAL FOR THE STUDY OF JUDAISM, v. 114]. Leiden – Boston: Brill 2007.

PART ONE of Orlov’s study is an exhaustive (near 100-page) “Bibliography of the Slavonic Pseudepigrapha and Related Literature”; PART TWO, “Studies in Slavonic Pseudepigrapha,” “contains several [17] essays previously published in journals inaccessible to many interested readers” (page XI).

In the introduction to the articles in PART TWO, Orlov writes

It should be noted that *2Enoch*, the *Apocalypse of Abraham*, and the *Ladder of Jacob* represent a unique group of texts that share a theophanic and mediatorial language that, in my view, is as different from the mainstream of early apocalyptic and pseudepigraphic writings as it is from later Hekhalot materials. This group of materials gives evidence of the lost *practical* and *literary* development that could very well represent an important transitional stage in early Jewish mystical testimonies, serving as a bridge from the matrix of early Jewish Apocalypticism, as it was manifested in early Enochic literature, to the matrix of early Jewish mysticism as it became manifest in rabbinic Merkabah and Hekhalot materials. The articles gathered in this volume intend to illustrate this transitional character of the Slavonic pseudepigraphic evidence by exploring theophanic and angelological imagery found in *2Enoch*, the *Ladder of Jacob*, the Slavonic version of *3 Baruch* and other pseudepigraphical texts preserved in Slavonic. It appears that the theophanic and angelological developments found in these documents occupy an intermediary stage between Second Temple Apocalypticism and Hekhalot mysticism and thus exhibit its own distinctive, one might say ‘proto-Hekhalot,’ mystical mold. (—page 105)

## 2009

- Rowland, Christopher; and Morray-Jones, Christopher R. A. *The Mystery of God: Early Jewish Mysticism and the New Testament* [COMPENDIA RERUM IUDAICARUM AD NOVUM TESTAMENTUM, volume 12]. Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009.

The major divisions of this 685-page volume could form three books:

PART I THINGS INTO WHICH ANGELS LONG TO LOOK: APPROACHING MYSTICISM FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE NEW TESTAMENT AND THE JEWISH APOCALYPSES  
(Christopher Rowland)

- PART II DIVINE NAMES, CELESTIAL SANCTUARIES, AND VISIONARY ASCENTS: APPROACHING THE NEW TESTAMENT FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF MERKAVAH TRADITIONS (*Christopher R. A. Morray-Jones*)  
 —includes “A Version of Hekhalot Zutarti” (see below, TEXTS & REFERENCES § B)
- PART III THE BODY OF GLORY: APPROACHING THE NEW TESTAMENT FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF SHIUR KOMA TRADITIONS (*Christopher R. A. Morray-Jones*) (see notes below, TEXTS & REFERENCES, § F. *Shi'ur Qomah*)

- Schäfer, Peter. *The Origins of Jewish Mysticism*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2009.

“Many scholars have dealt with Merkavah mysticism and its ramifications for classical rabbinic Judaism ... as well as with the origins of the Kabbalah in the Book of Bahir, but very few have paid full attention to the evidence of the Hebrew Bible, the apocalyptic literature, Qumran, and Philo. It is this gap between the Hebrew Bible and Merkavah mysticism that the present book wishes to address in a systematic and reflective manner.” (ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS—page XI)

In his introduction, Schäfer surveys previous research on the forerunners of Merkavah mysticism, in particular the studies of Gershom Scholem and Rachel Elior (see above, 1965 • *Jewish Gnosticism...etc.*, and 2004 • *The Three Temples*). He commences with Ezekiel (CHAPTER 1), then to the Enoch literature and related material (CHAPTERS 2 and 3). The section on Qumran (CHAPTER 4) addresses “Communion with Angels” while the section on Philo (CHAPTER 5) concentrates on “The Ascent of the Soul.” CHAPTER 6, “The Rabbis I,” takes up the “Cycle of Seven Stories” from the Tosefta (the four who entered *pardes*, Ben Zoma on the upper and lower waters, etc.); “The Rabbis II” (CHAPTER 7) discusses the Merkavah passages in YERUSHALMI and BAVLI (the same *Haggigah* sections discussed by Halperin—see above, 1980 • *Merkabah in Rabbinic Literature*). CHAPTER 8 treats “The Merkavah Mystics,” focusing, in particular, on *Hekhalot Zutarti*. CHAPTER 9 offers Schäfer’s conclusions and observations.

See also, Schäfer’s article

- “Communion with the Angels: Qumran and the Origins of Jewish Mysticism,” in *Weg e Mythischer Gotteserfahrung: Judentum, Christentum und Islam / Mystical Approaches to God: Judaism, Christianity, and Islam*, edited by Peter Schäfer (Munich: Oldenbourg, 2006)

## 2011

- Koren, Sharon Faye. *Forsaken: The Menstruant in Medieval Jewish Mysticism*. Waltham: Brandeis University Press: 2011.

See Koren’s PART I: EARLY JEWISH MYSTICISM, for a discussion of *Beraita d’Niddah* (TEACHINGS ON THE MENSTRUANT) and its connections with *hekhalot* literature.

Also refer below, TEXTS & REFERENCES, §Q, for a brief passage from *Forsaken* regarding *Beraita d’Niddah*.

## 2012

- Damsma, Alinda. *The Targumic Toseftot to Ezekiel* [STUDIES IN THE ARAMAIC INTERPRETATION OF SCRIPTURE, 13]. Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2012.

ABSTRACT from Brill’s website:

This book focuses on the additional liturgical and alternative readings of *Targum Ezekiel*, the so-called *Targumic Toseftot*. The critical text, translation, and commentary are presented with special reference to the long segments of unique mystical lore that are preserved in the *Targumic Toseftot* to Ezekiel 1, the chapter which describes the prophet’s vision of the celestial chariot. This unique manuscript material sheds light on a relatively dark chapter in the reception history of early Jewish mystical lore, being closely related to the *Hekhalot* literature, and to the *Shi’ur Qomah* tradition in

particular. The volume concludes with a systematic treatment of the *Targumic Toseftot* to Ezekiel in relation to their Aramaic dialect, date and provenance, as well as their historical and social setting.

Damsma takes up not only “The Order of the Heavens in Rabbinic Literature” but “The Order of the Underworlds...” as well.

## 2013

- *Hekhalot Literature in Context*, edited by Ra‘anan Boustan, Martha Himmelfarb, and Peter Schäfer [TEXTS & STUDIES IN ANCIENT JUDAISM, 153]. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2013.

### CONTENTS:

- Ra‘anan Boustan, “Introduction”

#### PART I. THE FORMATION OF HEKHALOT LITERATURE: LINGUISTIC, LITERARY, AND CULTURAL CONTEXTS

- Noam Mizrahi, “The Language of Hekhalot Literature: Preliminary Observations”
- Peter Schäfer, “Metatron in Babylonia”
- Michael D. Swartz, “Hekhalot and Piyut: From Byzantium to Babylonia and Back”
- Alexei Sivertsev, “The Emperor’s Many Bodies: The Demise of Emperor Lupinus Revisited”
- Klaus Herrmann, “Jewish Mysticism in Byzantium: The Transformation of Merkavah Mysticism in 3 Enoch”
- David M. Grossberg, “Between 3 Enoch and Bavli *Hagigah*: Heresiology and Orthopraxy in the Ascent of Elisha ben Abuyah”
- Moulie Vidas, “Hekhalot Literature, the Babylonian Academies, and the *tanna’im*”

#### PART II. THE TRANSMISSION AND RECEPTION OF HEKHALOT LITERATURE: TOWARD THE MIDDLE AGES

- Peter Schäfer, “The Hekhalot Genizah”
- Gideon Bohak, “Observations on the Transmission of Hekhalot Literature in the Cairo Genizah”
- Ophir Münz-Manor, “A Prolegomenon to the Study of Hekhalot Traditions in European Piyut”

#### PART III. EARLY JEWISH MYSTICISM IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE: THEMES AND PATTERNS

- Reimund Leicht, “Major Trends in Rabbinic Cosmology”
- Rebecca Lesses, “Women and Gender in the Hekhalot Literature”
- Andrei A. Orlov, “What is Below? Mysteries of Leviathan in the Early Jewish Accounts and Mishnah *Hagigah* 2:1”
- Michael Meerson, “Rites of Passage in Magic and Mysticism”
- Annette Yoshiko Reed, “Rethinking (Jewish-)Christian Evidence for Jewish Mysticism”

- Davila, James R. *Hekhalot Literature in Translation: Major Texts of Merkavah Mysticism*. Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2013. (hereafter *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*)

English translations of *Hekhalot Rabbati*, *Sar Torah* material, *Hekhalot Zutarti*, *Ma’aseh Merkavah*, *Merkavah Rabba*, *The Chapter of R. Nehuniah ben haQanah*, *The Great Seal/Fearsome Crown*, *Sar Panim* material, *The Ascent of Elijah ben Avuyah*, *The Youth*, and the *hekhalot* fragments from the Cairo Geniza, “based mainly on the seven manuscripts published in a synoptic edition by Schäfer in the *Synopse*” (INTRODUCTION, page 19).

(See my further comments on the next page.)

## Translations & References

### The *Hekhalot* Corpus

The number of *hekhalot* texts in translation has grown, albeit slowly, over the years, culminating with James R. Davila's *Hekhalot Literature in Translation: Major Texts of Merkavah Mysticism* (2013—see above, page 21), which includes all of the major works except

- 3 *Enoch*, deferring to P. S. Alexander's “excellent English translation”—Davila, page 7—in Charlesworth's *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*;
- *Masekhet Hekhalot*, in that “it is doubtful that this text should be included in the Hekhalot corpus”—*ibid.*, page 9;
- the *Shi'ur Qomah* corpus, given that “its relationship to the other Hekhalot texts is somewhat tangential”—*ibid.*, referring the reader to the work on *Shi'ur Qomah* by Martin Cohen.

Here we enter directly into the question of what *is* and what *is not* a member of the *hekhalot* family; the canons offered by various scholars differ. For instance, Schäfer's *Synopse* includes some items which many commentators find dubious, namely, THE SWORD OF MOSES and *Seder Rabba di Bereshit*. One well-known text, THE VISIONS OF EZEKIEL, while almost always included on lists of *hekhalot* texts, is clearly of a character different from the so-called “core group.” Davila's exclusion of *Masekhet Hekhalot* from the canon is certain to draw some criticism.<sup>9</sup>

Discussions on which texts belong to the *hekhalot* canon have progressed along several lines:

1. Texts which have long been counted among the *hekhalot* are now thought not to belong, for example, THE VISIONS OF EZEKIEL.
2. Magical works, such as THE SWORD OF MOSES and *Sefer ha-Razim*, are being drawn closer to the *hekhalot*.
3. Some works are being wholly reconsidered in that they might not be *works* at all but rather of one *genre* or another, as, for instance, the *Shi'ur Qomah* and *Sar Torah* texts.

As mentioned already, even the titles of these “books” are late inventions which have become *conventions*, used even by the scholars who refute their validity.

Drawing on the lists of *hekhalot* given by a number of contemporary scholars, below is a reference outline of sources on various *hekhalot* titles, erring in favor of inclusion.

---

<sup>9</sup> *Masekhet Hekhalot* is a mixture of *hekhalot* and other materials, which its author/compiler blends and alters rather freely. There is indeed an *after-the-fact* quality to this text.

## The “Core Group” of *Hekhalot* Texts

§ numbers given in braces { ... } are section (*microform*) numbers established in  
*Synopse zur Hekhalot Literatur* (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1981)

- A. *Hekhalot Rabbati* [THE GREATER PALACES] (HR) {§§ 81-277}  
*Sar Torah* [PRINCE OF THE TORAH] {§§ 278-306}

Translations:

1. HR chapters 1-30 (i.e., the complete text, including the *Sar Torah* appendix), translated by Morton Smith from an unpublished edition prepared by G. Scholem and C. Wirszubski; my annotated transcription of this translation is online at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/HekRab/index.php>
2. HR {§§ 81-277} and *Sar Torah* {§§ 281-306} in Davila, *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*.
3. HR chapters 15-29, prepared by Lauren Grodner—which includes §§ 281-287 from *Sar Torah*—in David R. Blumenthal’s *Understanding Jewish Mysticism* (New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1978), where it is referred to as “Pirkei Heikalot.”
4. HR chapters 1, 2, and 16-26, in Aryeh Kaplan’s *Meditation and Kabbalah* (York Beach: Samuel Weiser, 1982).
5. HR chapters 15:1-22:2 (with omissions), in Philip S. Alexander’s *Textual Sources for the Study of Judaism* (Totowa: Barnes and Noble, 1984; rpt., University of Chicago Press, 1990).
6. *Sar Torah* {§§ 278-280 and 281-306 (from HR mss), 307-314 (which fall outside the text usually incorporated into HR), 560-570 (which appear in *Ma’aseh Merkavah*), and 675-697 (from *Merkavah Rabba*)}, along with other *Sar Torah* rituals and related texts can be found in English translation in Michael Swartz’ *Scholastic Magic*, CHAPTERS 4 and 5.
7. HR chapters 13-17 {§§ 198-224}, in Joseph Dan, *The Heart and Fountain: An Anthology of Jewish Mystical Experiences* (Oxford – New York: Oxford University Press, 2002): CHAPTER 1.
8. HR chapters 5 and 6 {§§ 107-121} (*The Story of the Ten Martyrs* up to the *First Apocalypse*), “annotated translation” = APPENDIX C of Ra’anan Abusch’s dissertation, FROM MARTYR TO MYSTIC (listed above: 2005 • Boustan).

B. References to HR throughout the following:

- Gruenwald. AMM.
- Schäfer. HMG.
- Kuyt. DESCENT.
- Lesses. *Ritual Practices*.

See also

- Arbel, Daphna. “Pure Marble Stones or Water? On Ecstatic Perception, Group Identity, and Authority in Hekhalot and Merkavah Literature,” in *Studies in Spirituality*, Volume 16 (Kampen: Kok Pharos, 2006), pp. 21-38.
- Boustan, Ra’anan. *From Martyr to Mystic: Rabbinic Martyrology and the Making of Merkavah Mysticism*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005.
- Boustan, Ra’anan S. “Rabbi Ishmael’s Priestly Genealogy in *Hekhalot* Literature,” in *Paradise Now*—see above, page 17.
- Dan, Joseph. *The Revelation of the Secret World: The Beginning of Jewish Mysticism*. Providence: Brown University Press, 1992; = JM1: Chapter 3.
- Davila, James R. “Prolegomena to a Critical Edition of the *Hekhalot Rabbati*,” in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 45, no. 2 (Cambridge: The Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies, 1994).

- Halperin, David. “A Sexual Image in Hekhalot Rabbati and Its Implications,” in *Jerusalem Studies in Jewish Thought*, vol. 6, nos. 1-2, edited by Joseph Dan (Jerusalem: The Hebrew University, 1987).
- Janowitz, Naomi. “Using Names, Letters, and Praise: The Language of Ascent” = CHAPTER 5 of *Icons of Power: Ritual Practices in Late Antiquity* [MAGIC IN HISTORY] University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2002.
- Schiffman, Lawrence. “The Recall of Rabbi Nehuniah ha-Qanah from Ecstasy in the Hekhalot Rabbati,” in *AJS Review*, vol. 1 (Cambridge: Association for Jewish Studies, 1976).
- Smith, Morton. “Observations on Hekhalot Rabbati,” in *Biblical and Other Studies*, edited by Alexander Altmann (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1963).
- Wolfson. *SPECULUM*, chapter 3.

Often appended to HR in manuscripts is “The Book of the Great Name” {§§ 489-495}.<sup>10</sup> For an introduction and translation, see Michael D. Swartz, “The Book of the Great Name,” in *Judaism in Practice from the Middle Ages through the Early Modern Period* [PRINCETON READINGS IN RELIGIONS], edited by Lawrence Fine (Princeton – Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001). Portions are also translated by Ithamar Gruenwald in *From Apocalypticism to Gnosticism*, pages 267-270.

C. *Hekhalot Zutreti*, OR *Zutarti* [THE LESSER PALACES] (HZ) {§§ 335-374, 407-419}

Editions and Translations: Two editions of HZ in the original Hebrew and Aramaic have appeared (i) Schäfer’s *Synopse*, and (ii) a problematic “critical edition” by Rachel Elior (Jerusalem: Magnes Press, Hebrew University, 1982). For a review of these two editions, see David Halperin’s “A New Edition of the Hekhalot Literature,” in *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, vol. 104, no. 3 (1984).

Christopher R. A. Morray-Jones offers “A Version of Hekhalot Zutarti”—in English—in *The Mystery of God: Early Jewish Mysticism and the New Testament* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009—detailed above, 2009 • Rowand/Morray-Jones), stating (pages 268-9)

The version of HekhZ that follows includes all of the material included by both Schäfer and Elior (§§ 335-374 and 407-419) plus § 375 (included by Elior but not by Schäfer) and the Akiva ‘postscript’ (422-424). § 347 (MS. Munich 40 only), where the copyist has mistakenly repeated the first words of § 337, is disregarded.

Owing to the redactional complexity of the HekhZ macroform, it cannot be claimed that this version represents an ‘original’ or ‘authoritative’ text of HekhZ. Schäfer’s contention that no such text ever existed is basically correct. It is therefore necessary to take account of the different sources and layers of literary activity found in the manuscripts, including the distinctive literary tradition represented by passages of MS. New York. It can, however, be said that the materials included in this version are the basic ingredients of the early HekhZ literary tradition, that they were amalgamated with each other in something like this form during the early centuries of the common era, and that at least some of the materials preserved in this collection must be very old indeed.

In *Transparent Illusion*, Morray-Jones’ analyzes in detail two sections of HZ: the “ancient midrash … which includes the water vision episode” (§§ 407-412) in CHAPTER THREE, and the “throne midrash” (§§ 368-375) in CHAPTER EIGHT, section 2.

<sup>10</sup> Davila, in *Hekhalot Literature...*, pp. 38, 40, and 189) refers to §§ 489-495 simply as “an Aramaic magical handbook.”

HZ in English is also in James Davila's *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*.

Many important passages from HZ are given in Halperin's FACES and Schäfer's *Origins of Jewish Mysticism* (§ HEKHALOT ZUTARTI, pages 282-306).

References: AMM, FACES, HMG, DESCENT, *Ritual Practices*, Scholem's *Jewish Gnosticism*, and Arbel, Daphna. "Pure Marble Stones or Water? On Ecstatic Perception, Group Identity, and Authority in Hekhalot and Merkavah Literature," in *Studies in Spirituality*, Volume 16 (Kampen: Kok Pharos, 2006), pp. 21-38.

D. *Sefer Hekhalot* [BOOK OF PALACES] = Hebrew Book of Enoch = 3 Enoch (3E) {§§ 1-80}

Translations:

1. Odeberg, Hugo. *3 Enoch or The Hebrew Book of Enoch*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1928; rpt. New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1973. Chapters 1, 4, 10, and 41 of this translation are online at the WORK OF THE CHARIOT site: <http://www.workofthechariot.com/TextFiles/Translations-Enoch.html>
2. Alexander, P. "3 (Hebrew Apocalypse of) Enoch: A New Translation and Introduction," in *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, edited by James Charlesworth (Garden City: Doubleday and Company, 1983).
3. Dan, Joseph. *The Heart and the Fountain*, CHAPTER 3: 3E CHAPTERS I-XVI.
4. Nyland, Dr. A[nn]. *Third Book of Enoch (3 Enoch, Merkabah Book Hebrew Book of Enoch)*. Uralla: Smith and Stirling Publishers/CreateSpace, 2010.
5. Lumpkin, Joseph B. *The Books of Enoch: The Complete Volume Containing 1 ENOCH (The Ethiopic Book of Enoch), 2 ENOCH (The Slavonic Book of Enoch), and 3 ENOCH (The Hebrew Book of Enoch)*. Blountsville: Fifth Estate, 2010.

The back cover of Lumpkin's *Books of Enoch* claims that "[u]ntil now, the Hebrew Book of Enoch has not been available to the general public since 1928," indicating no knowledge of either the 1973 Ktav reprint of Odeberg or Alexander's translation within Charlesworth's *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha* (1983), which contains all three "Books of Enoch" with full scholarly treatment, pages 5-315. In fact, Lumpkin's version of 3E is a slight reworking of Odeberg's translation and notes.

References: AMM, HMG, *Ritual Practices*, and the following articles by P. S. Alexander:

- "Appendix: 3 Enoch," in Emil Schürer, *The History of the Jewish People in the Age of Jesus Christ*, A New English Version, revised and edited by G. Vermes, F. Millar, and M. Goodman. Edinburgh: T & T Clark Ltd., 1986: volume 3, part 1.
- "The Historical Setting of the Hebrew Book of Enoch," in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 28, no. 2 (The Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies, 1977).
- "3 Enoch and the Talmud," in *Journal for the Study of Judaism*, vol. 17, no. 2 (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1986).

See Lawrence Kaplan's "Adam, Enoch, and Metatron" (in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Six, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam [Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2001]) where Kaplan, among other things, argues that the notion of Enoch's being transformed into Metatron is original to 3 Enoch.

See above, **2006 • Paradise Now**: articles by Rebecca Lesses and Daphna Arbel; and Schäfer's *Origins of Jewish Mysticism*: § 3 ENOCH (pages 315-327).

#### E. *Merkabah Rabba* [THE GREAT CHARIOT] (MR) {§§ 655-708}

A complete MR in English is offered in Davila's *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*. Some few paragraphs of MR translated in

- Appendix One of Janowitz' *Poetics of Ascent* (§§ 675-678; noted above)
- Swartz' *Scholastic Magic* (§§ 675-676, §§ 680-687)
- Cohen's *Shi'ur Qomah* (§§ 688-708; see below: F. *Shi'ur Qomah*).

We must then turn to Schäfer's HMG, Kuyt's outline in DESCENT, and Lesses' references in *Ritual Practices*.

Gruenwald's chapter on MR in AMM begins with a description of material which does not really belong to it, namely, a portion of the *Sar ha-Panim* (ShP, PRINCE OF THE PRESENCE, or COUNTENANCE) {§§ 623-639}. Peter Schäfer treats ShP as an independent text in "Die Beschwörung des *sar ha-panim*: Kritische Edition und Übersetzung" (THE ADJURATION OF THE PRINCE OF THE COUNTENANCE: CRITICAL EDITION AND TRANSLATION), originally in *Frankfurter Judaische Beiträge*, vol. 6 (1978); reprinted in Schäfer's *Hekhalot-Studien*. Of course, Schäfer's translation is in German, but all is not lost. The same text has been put into English a number of times; refer to Section O, below.

#### F. *Ma'aseh Merkabah* [WORK OF THE CHARIOT] (MM) {§§ 544-596}

Translations:

- Dan, *The Heart and the Fountain*, CHAPTER 2:  
§§ 554-555 (=Janowitz' Section 6; Swartz' pages 231-233)  
§§ 583-586 (=Janowitz' Sections 24-26; Swartz' pages 242-243)
- Davila, *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*, translates §§ 544-596
- Janowitz, Naomi. *The Poetics of Ascent*, translates §§ 544-596
- Swartz, Michael. *Mystical Prayer in Ancient Judaism*, translates §§ 544-596
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Scholastic Magic*, translates §§ 571-578

References: Along with the four books listed under "Translations," the last three of which offer a full analysis of the text, see AMM, HMG, *Ritual Practices*, and

- Daniel Abrams' "Ma'aseh Merkabah as a Literary Work: The Reception of the Hekhalot Traditions by German Pietist and Kabbalistic Reinterpretation," in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, Volume 5, No. 4 (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1998)
- Christopher R. A. Morray-Jones' article "The Temple Within" (in *Paradise Now*, page 161) translates a passage from MM (Scholem's *Gnosticism...APPENDIX C: § 6 / Schäfer's Synopse* §§ 544-45)

#### G. *Shi'ur Qomah* [MEASURE OF THE HEIGHT {of the Divine Body}] (SQ)

David Halperin suggests (FACES, p. 364) that SQ "probably ought to be considered a generic term for materials describing God's organs rather than a single texts." Martin S. Cohen (in his book listed below) holds out for SQ's having been an independent, freestanding work, complete with a lost *urtext* looming in back of the extant versions. SQ has been included here in the "Core Group" because nearly all of the texts discussed so far contain SQ material: HR, HZ, 3E, and MR.

## Translations:

- Cohen, Martin Samuel. *The Shi'ur Qomah. Liturgy and Theurgy in Pre-Kabbalistic Jewish Mysticism*. Lanham: University Press of America, 1983.
- Work of the Chariot. #3 *Book of Enoch*. Los Angeles: Work of the Chariot, 1970. This work contains 1 and 2 Enoch from R. H. Charles' *Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha of the Old Testament* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1913), 3E from Odeberg, along with the translation of SQ. The same SQ translation appears in *The Secret Garden*, edited by David Meltzer (New York: Seabury Press, 1976: pp. 23-37).
- Davila. *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*, pp. 366-369.

References: Scholem's *Jewish Gnosticism and Mystical Shape of the Godhead*, CHAPTER 1 (New York: Schocken Books, 1991). Further, see

- Abrams, Daniel. "The Dimensions of the Creator—Contradiction or Paradox? Corruptions and Accretions of the Manuscript Witness," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume 5, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles [Culver City]: Cherub Press, 2000).
- Dan, Joseph. "The Concept of Knowledge in the *Shi'ur Qomah*," in *Studies in Jewish Religious and Intellectual History* [Presented to Alexander Altmann on the Occasion of His Seventieth Birthday], edited by Siegfried Stein and Raphael Loewe (University of Alabama Press/Institute of Jewish Studies: 1979); also, JM1: Chapter 8.
- Janowitz, Naomi. "God's Body: Theological and Ritual Roles of *Shi'ur Komah*," in *People of the Body: Jews and Judaism from an Embodied Perspective*, edited by Howard Eilberg-Schwartz [SUNY SERIES: THE BODY IN CULTURE, HISTORY AND RELIGION]. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992.
- Katz, Steven T. "The 'Conservative' Character of Mystical Experience," in *Mysticism and Religious Experience* (Oxford – New York: Oxford University Press, 1983).
- Loewe, Raphael. "The Divine Garment and *Shi'ur Qomah*," in *Harvard Theological Review*, volume 58 (Cambridge: Harvard College, 1965); includes translated excerpts of *Targum Song of Songs*.
- Morray-Jones, Christopher R. A. THE BODY OF GLORY: APPROACHING THE NEW TESTAMENT FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF *SHIUR KOMAH* TRADITIONS, which is Part III of *The Mystery of God* (see above, 2009 • Rowland/Morray-Jones)
- Orlov, Andrei A. "The Watchers of Satanail [or Satanael]: The Fallen Angels Traditions in 2 (Slavonic) *Enoch*," § III. THE TRANSITIONAL TEMPLATE AND ITS AFTERLIFE IN THE *SHI'UR QOMAH* AND HEKHALOT ACCOUNTS, in
  - *Divine Manifestations in the Slavonic Pseudepigrapha* [ORIENTALIA JUDAICA CHRISTIANA, 2] Piscataway: Gorgias Press, 2009, pages 261-267.
  - *Selected Studies in the Slavonic Pseudepigrapha*, Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009, 155-162.
  - *Dark Mirrors: Azazel and Satanael in Early Jewish Demonology*, Albany: State University of New York Press, 2011, pages 99-105.
- Schäfer's *Origins of Jewish Mysticism*, § *SHI'UR QOMAH*, pages 306-315.
- Scholem, Gershom. *Origins of the Kabbalah*, translated from the German by Allan Arkush. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society/Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987: CHAPTER 1, § 3. THE ESOTERIC DOCTRINE OF THE CREATION AND THE MERKABAH IN PRE-KABBALISTIC JUDAISM: THE LITERATURE OF THE HEKHALOTH AND JEWISH Gnosticism, pages 18-24.
- Wolfson, Elliot R. "Metatron and *Shi'ur Qomah* in the Writings of the Haside Ashkenaz," in *Mysticism, Magic and Kabbalah in Ashkenazi Judaism: International Symposium held in Frankfurt a. M. 1991*, edited by Karl Erich Grözinger and Joseph Dan [STUDIA JUDAICA: Band XIII]. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1995.

## Texts Associated with the *Hekhalot* Corpus

The texts listed in the following set are those which are usually included in summaries and lists of *hekhalot* literature.

### H. *Re'uyot Yehezkiel* [VISIONS OF EZEKIEL] (RY)

Translations:

- Jacobs, Louis. *Jewish Mystical Testimonies*. New York: Schocken Books, 1976: CHAPTER 3.
- Marmorstein, A. “A Fragment of the Visions of Ezekiel,” in *Jewish Quarterly Review*, New Series #8 (1917-18).
- Halperin, David. FACES: Chapter VIII, § A.

References: The best source for information on RY is Halperin’s FACES.

### I. *Masekhet Hekhalot* [TREATISE OF THE PALACES] (MH)

Gruenwald’s chapter (AMM) on MH begins with these encouraging words: “*Masekhet Hekhalot* is the most frequently published Hekhalot text we have.” Alas, this comment reflects the state of the text in Hebrew, though there are two German translations: (i) by August Wunsche in *Aus Israelis Lehrbällen* III (1909); and (ii) by Klaus Herrmann, *Massahet Hekhalot: Edition, Übersetzung und Kommentar* [TEXTE UND STUDIEN ZUM ANTIKEN JUDENTUM, 39], Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1994. There is also a French translation by Nicolas Sed within his “Deux documents sur la kabbale: *Le Commentaire sur le Sepher Yesirah* de Moïse ben Nahman et le *Traité des Heykalot*,” in *Documents oubliés sur l’alchimie, la kabbale et Guillaume Postel*, offerts, à l’occasion de son 90<sup>e</sup> anniversaire, à François Secret par ses élèves et amis, “Scientific editor”: Sylvain Matton (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 2001).

James Davila did not include MH in *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*, stating that “it is doubtful that this text should be included in the Hekhalot corpus” (—*ibid.*, page 9).

### J. *Hekhalot* fragments, or Cairo Geniza(h) fragments (CG)

In 1968-9, Gruenwald published (in Hebrew) “New Passages from Hekhalot Literature,” in *Tarbiz*, vol. 38, no. 4; these were the newly-discovered Geniza fragments. They have been published subsequently in Peter Schäfer’s *Geniza-Fragmente zur Hekhalot-Literatur* (see note 7 above, pages 2-3). A selection has been put into English in James Davila’s *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*.

Further see FACES, DESCENT, *Ritual Practices*, Swartz’ *Scholastic Magic*, and

- Jonathan Seidel’s article, “Possession and Exorcism in the Magical Texts of the Cairo Geniza,” in *Spirit Possession in Judaism: Cases and Contexts from the Middle Ages to the Present*, edited by Matt Goldish (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2003).
- Two articles in *Hekhalot Literature in Context* (noted above, page 21): Peter Schäfer, “The Hekhalot Genizah” and Gideon Bohak, “Observations on the Transmission of Hekhalot Literature in the Cairo Genizah.”

### K. Fragments on Physiognomy, Chiromancy, and Metoposcopy

A number of these fragments have been published by Gruenwald (in *Tarbiz*, vol. 40, 1970) and Scholem (in *Sefer Assaf*, Jerusalem: 1953), in Hebrew. One fragment is

discussed and translated into German by Schäfer in “Ein neues Fragment zur Metopskopie und Chiromantik” (in *Hekhalot-Studien*). Not only is there nothing of these texts in English translation, but Gruenwald (in AMM) never really gets around to detailing their contents. See Scholem’s article, “Chiromancy,” in *Kabbalah*.

The list of *hekhalot* texts up to this point contains all items listed by Scholem in *Jewish Gnosticism* (pp. 5-7), plus the Genizah fragments which Gruenwald includes in his account in AMM. Gruenwald also adds

L. *Sefer ha-Razim* [BOOK OF THE MYSTERIES] (ShR)

Translation:

- Morgan, Michael. *Sefer ha-Razim. The Book of the Mysteries*. [TEXTS AND TRANSLATIONS 25; PSEUDEPIGRAPHA SERIES 11]. Chico: Society of Biblical Literature/Scholars Press, 1983.

References:

- AMM, pages 225-234.
- Janowitz, Naomi. *Icons of Power: Ritual Practices in Late Antiquity* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2002), CHAPTER 6: “Combining Words and Deeds: Angelic Imprecations in *The Book of Secrets*.”
- Torijano, Pablo A. *Solomon the Esoteric King: From King to Magus, Development of a Tradition* (Leiden – Boston – Koln: Brill, 2002), CHAPTER 9, § SOLOMON THE MAGICIAN IN *SEFER HA-RAZIM*, pages 198-208.
- Alexander, Philip S. “*Sefer ha-Razim* and the Problem of Black Magic in Early Judaism,” in *Magic in the Biblical World: From the Rod of Aaron to the Ring of Solomon*, edited by Todd E. Klutz (London: T&T Clark International, 2003) which offers a full analysis and translated excerpts.
- Bloom, Maureen. “Imprecations, Healing, and Protection: The ‘Book of Secrets’, amulets, incantation bowls” = CHAPTER 11 of *Jewish Mysticism and Magic: An Anthropological Perspective* [ROUTLEDGE JEWISH STUDIES SERIES] (London – New York: Routledge, 2007).
- Bohak, Gideon. *Ancient Jewish Magic: A History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pages 170-175.

The following items are frequently associated with the *hekhalot* cluster:

M. *Baraita de Ma’aseh Bereshit, OR Seder Rabbah di Bereshit* [TEACHING ON THE WORK OF CREATION, or GREAT ORDER OF CREATION] (BMB) {§§ 428-467, §§ 743-820}

Translation:

- In Meltzer’s *Secret Garden*, pp. 3-20. This translation appears to have been done from the French of N. Sed: “Une cosmologie juive du haut moyen age: La Béraita di Ma’aseh Bèrešit,” in *Revue des Etudes juives*, vol. 123 (1964); also in Sed’s *La mystique cosmologique juive* (Paris: Éditions de l’École des hautes études en sciences sociales, 1981). Peter Schäfer points out (in a note to the article listed immediately below—p. 233, n. 4) that “Sed did not, however, have all the relevant manuscript evidence at his disposal.”

References:

- Gottstein, Alon Goshen. “Is *Ma’aseh Bereshit* Part of Ancient Jewish Mysticism?” in *The Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, VOLUME 4 (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1995).

- Schäfer, Peter. “In Heaven as It Is in Hell: The Cosmology of *Seder Rabbah di-Bereshit*,” in *Heavenly Realms and Earthly Realities in Late Antique Religions*, edited by Ra’anan S. Boustan and Annette Yoshiko Reed (Cambridge – New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 233-274.

N. *Harba de Moshe* [SWORD OF MOSES] (HdM) {§§ 598-622, §§ 640-650}

Translations:

- Gaster, Moses. *The Sword of Moses*. (London: D. Nutt, 1896; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1970—see comments above in § D.)  
This translation is online at Joseph Peterson’s TWILIT GROTTO: ARCHIVES OF WESTERN ESOTERICA (aka ESOTERIC ARCHIVES) > <http://www.esotericarchives.com/solomon/sword.htm>, where Peterson has restored the “holy” or “mysterious” names omitted by Gaster.
- Harari, Yuval. “The Sword of Moses (*Harba de-Moshe*): A New Translation and Introduction,” in *Magic, Ritual, and Witchcraft*, volume 7, number 1 (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012), pp. 58-98.

Reference:

- Bohak, Gideon. *Ancient Jewish Magic: A History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pages 175-179

N. *Ottijot* [ALPHABET] of Rabbi Akiba (ORA)

Translations (excerpts):

- Alexander, P. “3 (Hebrew Book of Enoch” in Charlesworth, *Old Testament Pseudepigraphy* (see above, § C). CHAPTER 48C:1-9 contains material taken from the Akiba text.
- Bokser, Ben Zion. *The Jewish Mystical Tradition*. New York: Pilgrim Press, 1981: CHAPTER 3 contains excerpts of ORA and HR.

O. *Sar ha-Panim* [PRINCE OF THE PRESENCE, or COUNTENANCE] (ShP) {§§ 623-639}

Translations:

- Moses Gaster in *The Sword of Moses* (London: D. Nutt, 1896; rpt. New York: Samuel Weiser, 1970): Appendix I, § III, pp. 47-51; also in *Studies and Texts...* (see below): vol. 1, pp. 288-337; vol. 3, pp. 69-103. Schäfer does not think Gaster’s rendering is terribly accurate, commenting, “The translation is overall fluid and easy to read but often rather fanciful.” (*Hekhalot-Studien*, page 122: “[D]ie Übersetzung ist insgesamt flüssig und gut lesbar, doch häufig recht phantasievoll.” My thanks to Sabine Baumgart for the translation.)
- Michael Swartz in *Scholastic Magic* (described above, page 8) on pp. 135-147.
- James Davila in *Hekhalot Literature in Translation* (described above, pages 21 and 22) on pp. 356-366.

Further, see

- Lesses, Rebecca. *Ritual Practices*, pp. 190-203 and numerous other references, e.g., ShP is outlined and its contents analyzed in *Ritual Practices*, pp. 415-17.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “The Adjuration of the Prince of the Presence: Performative Utterance in a Jewish Ritual,” in *Ancient Magic and Ritual Power*, edited by Marvin Meyer and Paul Mirecki [RELIGIONS IN THE GRECO-ROMAN WORLD, 129]. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995.

Refer also to § D above (MR).

P. *Tosefta* to the *Targum* on Ezekiel (TE)

- Damsma, Alinda. *The Targumic Toseftot to Ezekiel* (Leiden-Boston: Brill, 2012).
- Halperin's FACES, pp. 278-283.
- Levey, Samson H. "The Targum to Ezekiel," in *Hebrew Union College Annual*, xlvi (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College, 1975), pp. 139-158.

Q. *Beraita d'Niddah* [TEACHING OF THE MENSTRUANT] (BdN)

In *Forsaken: The Menstruant in Medieval Jewish Mysticism* (Waltham: Brandeis University Press: 2011), Sharon Faye Koren writes (page 36),

Saul Lieberman was the first scholar to associate the strict purity laws of the BdN with the legal philosophy formulated in Hekhalot literature, and Michael Stone [*Scholastic Magic*, pages 182-185] and Rebecca Lesses [*Ritual Practices*, pages 134-144] have noted a connection between the BdN and the ascetic rituals required for *Sar Torah* adjurations. I believe that there is an even stronger connection. The BdN not only informs the ascetic rituals in some Hekhalot texts but also independently reflects a mystical consciousness. The authors of traditions in the BdN, like the authors of Hekhalot literature, were trying to discover a viable spiritual solution to a Judaism without a Temple.

In *Hekhalot Literature in Translation*, James Davila includes a chapter on shorter *hekhalot* texts ("Some Shorter Macroforms") which "may be counted as macroforms in their own right" (—Davila, page 350). These include

- *The Chapter of Nebuniah ben HaQanah*, which has also been translated and analyzed by David Halperin in FACES (pp. 378-380) and Michael Swartz in *Scholastic Magic* (pp. 67-74)—even previously by Davila in *Descenders to the Chariot* (pp. 110-113)—and translated by Rebecca Lesses in *Ritual Practices* (pp. 412-415);
- *The Great Seal-Fearsome Crown*;
- *The Ascent of Elisha ben Aviyah*, also covered briefly by Halperin in FACES (p.410);
- *Sar Panim*, sources of which have been outlined above in Section O;
- *The Youth*, also treated elsewhere most significantly by Davila (*The Dead Sea Scrolls in their Historical Context*, edited by T. Lim *et al* [Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 2000], pp. 249-264, and Andrei Orlov (*The Enoch-Metatron Tradition* [Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005]). See also various references in Halperin's FACES.

## A Selection of Books & Articles

- Abelson, J[oshua]. *Jewish Mysticism: An Introduction to the Kabbalah*. London: G. Bell and Sons, 1913; rpt. New York: Sepher-Hermon Press, 1969 & 1981; and Mineola: Dover Publications, Inc., 2001: Chapter II. “The Merkabah (Chariot) Mysticism”
- Abrams, Daniel. “The Boundaries of Divine Ontology: The Inclusion of Metatron in the Godhead,” in *Harvard Theological Review*, vol. 87, no. 3 (Cambridge: 1994)
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Ma’aseh Merkabah as a Literary Work: The Reception of the Hekhalot Traditions by the German Pietists and Kabbalistic Interpretation,” in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, vol. 5, no. 4 (1998), Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Special Angelic Figures: The Career of the Beasts of the Throne-World in *Hekhalot* Literature, German Pietism and Early Kabbalistic Literature,” *Revue des Études juives*, vol. 155 (3-4) (1996).
- Alexander, P[hilip]. S. “Comparing Merkavah Mysticism and Gnosticism: An Essay in Method,” in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 30, no. 1 (The Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies, 1984).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “The Family of Caesar and the Family of God: The Image of the Emperor in the Heikhatot Literature,” in *Images of Empire*, edited by Loveday Alexander [JOURNAL FOR THE STUDY OF OLD TESTAMENT SUPPLEMENT SERIES 122] (Sheffield: JSOT Press, 1991).
- Altmann, Alexander. “The Gnostic Background of the Rabbinic Adam Legends”
- VERSION 1. *Jewish Quarterly Review* 35 (Philadelphia – New York: Dropsie College and Macmillan, April 1945)
  - VERSION 2. (idem) *Essays in Jewish Intellectual History* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press / London: University Press of New England, 1981)
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Gnostic Motifs in Rabbinic Literature,” in (idem) *The Meaning of Jewish Existence: Theological Essays 1030-1939*, edited by Alfred L. Ivry (Hanover – London: Brandeis University Press/University Press of New England, 1991).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Gnostic Themes in Rabbinic Cosmology,” in *Essays in Honor of the Very Rev. Dr. J. H. Hertz*, edited by I. Epstein, E. Levine, and C. Roth (London: Edward Goldston, 1942)
- \_\_\_\_\_. “A Note on the Rabbinic Doctrine of Creation,” in (idem) *Studies in Religious Philosophy and Mysticism* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1965)
- Baron, Salo Wittmayer. “Magic and Mysticism,” in *A Social and Religious History of the Jews: High Middle Ages (500-1200)*, Volume VIII: Philosophy and Science. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1958.
- Baumgarten, Joseph M. “The Book of Elkesai and Merkabah Mysticism,” in *Journal for the Study of Judaism*, Vol. XVII, no. 2 (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1986).
- Bockmuehl, Markus N. A. *Revelation and Mystery in Ancient Judaism and Pauline Christianity* [WISSENSCHAFTLICHE UNTERSUCHUNGEN ZUM NEUEN TESTAMENT 2, Band 36]. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1990.
- Bohak, Gideon. *Ancient Jewish Magic: A History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Remains of Greek Words and Magical Formulae in Hekhalot Literature,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, vol. 6, edited by D. Abrams and A. Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2001).
- Borgen, Peder. “Heavenly Ascent in Philo: An Examination of Selected Passages,” in *The Pseudepigrapha and Early Biblical Interpretation*, edited by James H. Charlesworth and Craig A. Evans (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1993)
- Boustan, Ra’anan S. “The Study of Heikhalot Literature: Between Mystical Experience and Textual Artifact,” in *Currents in Biblical Research*, Vol. 6, No. 1 (London: Sheffield Academic Press, 2007).
- Couliano, I. P. *Out of This World. Otherworldly Journeys from Gilgamesh to Albert Einstein*. Boston and London: Shambhala, 1991: CHAPTER 9. “The Seven Palaces of God: Jewish Mysticism from Merkabah to Kabbalah.”

- Davidson, Maxwell J. *Angels at Qumran: A Comparative Study of 1 Enoch 1-36, 72-108 and the Sectarian Writings from Qumran* [JOURNAL FOR THE STUDY OF THE PSEUDEPIGRAPHA Supplement Series 11]. Sheffield: JSOT Press (Sheffield Academic Press), 1992.
- Deutsch, Nathaniel. "Dangerous Ascents: Rabbi Akiba's Water Warning and Late Antique Cosmological Traditions," in *The Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, vol. 8 (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1998)
- Duker, Sara. "Elijah Looked and Cut the Shoots: Making the Myths of the Other in Ancient Rabbinic Texts," in *Iggrot ha'Ari—The Lion's Letters* [COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY STUDENT JOURNAL OF JEWISH SCHOLARSHIP], Vol. 1, Issue 1 (Spring 1997/5757).
- Faur, José. *Homo Mysticus: A Guide to Maimonides's GUIDE FOR THE PERPLEXED*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1999: "Hekhalot Literature and Rabbinic Esoterics" (pages 29-33)
- Franken, H. J. *The Mystical Communion with JHVH in the Book of Psalms*. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1954.
- Gaster, Moses. "Hebrew Visions of Hell and Paradise," in *Studies and Texts in Folklore, Magic, Medieval Romance, Hebrew Apocrypha, and Samaritan Archaeology* (London: Maggs Brothers, 1925-8; rpt. New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1971): Vol. 1, pp. 124-164. *Studies and Texts...* also contains THE SWORD OF MOSES (see above: § D) and Gaster's study, "Das Schiur Komah" (in German): Vol. 2, pp. 1330-1353.
- Ginzberg, Louis. *The Legends of the Jews* (7 volumes). Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society of America, 1909-25, 1937-53; rpt. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998. For a summary of Enoch/Metatron material, see Volume 1, pp. 124-40, and, for notes on this summary, see Volume 5, pp. 153-64 (notes 57-61).
- Green, Deirdre. "The Seven Palaces in Early Jewish Mysticism," in *The Hermetic Journal*, Issue Number 31, edited by Adam McLean (Tysoe: Spring 1986).
- Gruenwald, Ithamar. *Rituals and Ritual Theory in Ancient Israel*. [BRILL REFERENCE LIBRARY OF ANCIENT JUDAISM] Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2003; rpt. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature [SBL], 2010.
- Herrmann, Klaus. "Jewish Mysticism in the Geonic Period: The Prayer of Rav Hamnuna Sava," in *Jewish Studies Between the Disciplines/Judaistik zwischen den Disziplinen: Papers in Honor of Peter Schäfer on the Occasion of His Sixtieth Birthday*, edited by Klaus Herrmann, Margarete Schlüter, and Giuseppe Veltri (Leiden – Boston: Brill 2003).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Re-written Mystical Texts: The Transmission of the Heikhalot Literature in the Middle Ages," in *Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester*, Volume 75 (Manchester: 1993).
- Himmelfarb, Martha. "Apocalyptic Ascent and the Heavenly Temple," in *Society of Biblical Literature 1987 Seminar Papers*, no. 26, edited by Harold Kent (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1987)
- Himmelfarb, Martha. *The Apocalypse: A Brief History* [BLACKWELL BRIEF HISTORIES OF RELIGION SERIES]. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010. See especially CHAPTER 6, "Tours of Paradise and Hell and the Hekhalot Texts."
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Ascent to Heaven in Jewish and Christian Apocalypses*. Oxford – New York: Oxford University Press, 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Between Temple and Torah: Essays on Priests, Scribes, and Visionaries in the Second Temple Period and Beyond* [TEXTS AND STUDIES IN ANCIENT JUDAISM, 151]. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2013.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The articles in [the] 'Heavenly Ascent' [section] consider the relationship between the ascent apocalypses of the Second Temple period and later works involving heavenly ascent, particularly the *hekhalot* texts"—from the book description at the Mohr Siebeck website.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Heavenly Ascent and the Relationship of the Apocalypses and the Hekhalot Literature," in *Hebrew Union College Annual* 59 (1988)
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Practice of Ascent in the Ancient Mediterranean World," in *Death, Ecstasy, and Other Worldly Journeys*, edited by J. Collins and M. Fishbane (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995)
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Tours of Hell: An Apocalyptic Form in Jewish and Christian Literature*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1983.

- Idel, Moshe. "Adam, Enoch, and Theodicy," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Six, edited by Daniels Abrams and Avraham Elqayam. Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2001.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Ascensions on High in Jewish Mysticism: Pillars, Lines, and Ladders*. Budapest – New York: Central European University Press, 2005: Chapter 1, § 2. "Heikhalot Literature: Precedents and Offshoots."
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Ben: Sonship and Jewish Mysticism* [THE KOGOD LIBRARY OF JUDAIC STUDIES 5]. London – New York: Shalom Hartman Institute / Continuum, 2007: Chapter 1. "Theophorism and Sonship in Rabbinic and Heikhalot Literatures."
- \_\_\_\_\_. "From Italy to Ashkenaz and Back: On the Circulation of Jewish Mystical Traditions," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Fourteen, edited by Daniels Abrams and Avraham Elqayam. Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2006.
- Jerusalem Studies in Jewish Thought*—see "Dan, Joseph (ed.)"
- Levenda, Peter. "Merkavah Mysticism and Ascent" = PART 2 of *Stairway to Heaven: Chinese Alchemists, Jewish Kabbalists, and the Art of Spiritual Transformation*. New York – London: Continuum, 2008.
- Luttkhuizen, Gerard P. "Monism and Dualism in Jewish-Mystical and Christian-Gnostic Ascent Texts," in *Interaction between Judaism and Christianity in History, Religion, Art and Literature*, edited by Marcel Poorthuis, Joshua Schwartz, and Joseph Turner [JEWISH AND CHRISTIAN PERSPECTIVES 17] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009)
- Mach, Michael. "From Apocalypticism to Early Jewish Mysticism?" in *Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism*, Volume 1: THE ORIGINS OF APOCALYPTICISM IN JUDAISM AND CHRISTIANITY, edited by John J. Collins (New York: Continuum Publishing Company, 1999)
- McGinn, Bernard. *The Foundations of Mysticism – Origins to the Fifth Century* [THE PRESENCE OF GOD: A HISTORY OF WESTERN CHRISTIAN MYSTICISM, volume 1]. New York: Crossroad, 1991: CHAPTER 1, "The Jewish Matrix."
- Merkur, Dan. *Gnosis: An Esoteric Tradition of Mystical Visions and Unions* [SUNY SERIES IN WESTERN ESOTERIC TRADITIONS]. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993: CHAPTER 7, "The Recital of the Chariot."
- Miller Michael T. "Chaos and Identity: Onomatology in the Hekhalot Literature," in *Bamidbar: Journal for Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, Issue 2.1 (Vienna: Passagen Verlag, 2011).
- Neusner, Jacob. "The Development of the Merkabah Tradition," in *Journal for the Study of Judaism*, vol. 2, no. 2 (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1971)
- Ostow, Mortimer. "The Psychodynamics of Merkavah Mysticism," in *The Ultimate Intimacy: The Psychodynamics of Jewish Mysticism* (Madison: International Universities Press, Inc., 1995)
- Quispel, Gilles. "Transformation through Vision in Jewish Gnosticism and the Cologne Mani Codex," in *From Poimandres to Jacob Bohme: Gnosis, Hermetism and the Christian Tradition*, edited by Roelof van den Broek and Cis van Heertum (Amsterdam – Leiden, Bibliotheca Philosophica Hermetica / Brill, 2000).
- Robertson, R. G. (trans). "Ezekiel the Tragedian," in *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, Volume 2, edited by James H. Charlesworth (Garden City: Doubleday & Company, Inc., 1985).
- Rowland, Christopher. *The Open Heaven: A Study of Apocalyptic in Judaism and Early Christianity*. New York: Crossroad, 1982.
- Russell, James R. "The Four Elements and the Cross in Armenian Spirituality, with an Excursus on the Descent in Merkavah Mysticism," in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, vol. 4, no. 4 (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck] 1997).
- Saldarini, Anthony J. "Apocalypses and 'Apocalyptic' in Rabbinic Literature and Mysticism," in *Semeia 14, APOCALYPSE: THE MORPHOLOGY OF THE GENRE*, edited by John J. Collins (Missoula: Scholars Press, University of Montana, 1979).
- Segal, Alan F. "Paul and the Beginning of Jewish Mysticism," in *Death, Ecstasy, and Other Worldly Journeys*, edited by J. Collins and M. Fishbane (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995)
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Transcribing Experience," in *With Letters of Light: Studies in the Dead Sea Scrolls, Early Jewish Apocalypticism, Magic, and Mysticism in Honor of Rachel Elior* [EKSTASIS: RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE

- FROM ANTIQUITY TO THE MIDDLE AGES, vol. 2], edited by Daphna V. Arbel and Andrei A. Orlov (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co., 2011).
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Two Powers in Heaven. Early Rabbinic Reports about Christianity and Gnosticism* [STUDIES IN JUDAISM IN LATE ANTIQUITY, XXVI]. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1977.
- Stökl ben Ezra, Daniel. *The Impact of Yom Kippur on Early Christianity*. [WISSENSCHAFTLICHE UNTERSUCHUNGEN ZUM NEUEN TESTAMENT, 163]. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Sbeck), 2003.
- Stroumsa, Guy G. [= Gedaliahu Stroumsa] “Form(s) of God: Some Notes on Metatron and Christ,” in *Harvard Theological Review*, vol. 76, no. 3 (Cambridge: 1983): CHAPTER 3, § 5. High-Priestly Visions of God III: Aspects of Yom Kippur in the Hekhalot Literature.”
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Mystical Descents” in
- *Death, Ecstasy, and Other Worldly Journeys*, edited by J. Collins and M. Fishbane (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995); and
  - = Chapter X, (*idem*) *Hidden Wisdom: Esoteric Traditions and the Roots of Christian Mysticism* [STUDIES IN THE HISTORY OF RELIGIONS, volume 70] (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996)
- Swartz, Michael D. “Ancient Jewish Mysticism,” in *Jewish Mysticism and Kabbalah: New Insights and Scholarship*, edited by Frederick E. Greenspahn (New York – London: New York University Press, 2011).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Mystical Texts,” in *The Literature of the Sages*, SECOND PART: *Midrash, Aggada, Targum, Berakhot, Vavia*, edited by Shmuel Safrai, Joshua Schwartz, and Peter Tomson (Assen: Royal Van Gorcum, 2006).
- Uždaviny, Algis. *Ascent to Heaven in Islamic and Jewish Mysticism*. London: The Matheson Trust, 2011.  
See in particular CHAPTER 11, “Abu Yazid and the hekhalot Theurgists.”
- Wallace, James Buchanan. *Snatched Into Paradise (2 Cor 12:1-10): Paul’s Heavenly Journey in the Context of Early Christian Experience*. Berlin – New York: Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co., 2011.  
§ 3.5. “Rabbinic Traditions and the Hekhalot Literature,” pages 152-164.

## Appendix 1: *Hekhalot* Literature & Magic

With the inclusion of such items as *Sefer ha-Razim*, the SWORD OF MOSES, and the *Sar ha-Panim* material in clusters of texts associated with *merkabah/hekhalot* mysticism, Jewish magic takes several steps closer to the rabbinic core of these traditions. Certainly, the convenient notion of a neat separation between ascent texts and magic texts can no longer be sustained. Of late, the tendency among scholars is to dismiss such loaded terms as “magic” (a negative term—vs “theurgy” or “religion,” positive terms) and “mysticism” to concentrate on the methods and aims of Jewish, usually along with early Christian and pagan (Greco-Roman), rituals and how these reflect the mindset and beliefs of their eras. On this trend, see, for example, Rebecca Macy Lesses’ *Ritual Practices to Gain Power* (summary statement on pages 11-13), James R. Davila’s *Descenders to the Chariot* (CHAPTER 2 discusses the difficulties of the words “mysticism,” “magic,” and “shamanism”), and Naomi Janowitz’ *Icons of Power* (INTRODUCTION).

To begin an approach to antique Jewish magic, refer to the following:

- Alexander, P. S. “Incantations and Books of Magic,” in Emil Schürer, *The History of the Jewish People in the Age of Jesus Christ*: A New English Version, revised and edited by G. Vermes, F. Millar, and M. Goodman (Edinburgh: T & T Clark Ltd, 1986): vol. 3, part 1.
- Bloom, Maureen. *Jewish Mysticism and Magic: An Anthropological Perspective* [ROUTLEDGE JEWISH STUDIES SERIES] (London – New York: Routledge, 2007). In the present context, note especially CHAPTER 10: “Approximating God, Appropriating Authority: *Hekhalot* and *Merkava* literature,” and CHAPTER 11: “Imprecations, Healing, and Protection: The ‘Book of Secrets’, amulets, incantation bowls.”
- Bohak, Gideon. *Ancient Jewish Magic: A History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008).
- Schäfer, Peter. “Jewish Magic Literature in Late Antiquity and Early Middle Ages,” in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 41, no. 1 (Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies, 1990).
- Idel, Moshe. “On Judaism, Jewish Mysticism and Magic,” in *Envisioning Magic: A Princeton Seminar and Symposium*, edited by P. Schäfer and H. Kippenberg [STUDIES IN THE HISTORY OF RELIGIONS: *Numen* Book Series #75] (Leiden: Brill, 1975).
- Schäfer, Peter. “Magic and Religion in Ancient Judaism,” in *Envisioning Magic*.
- Shaked, Shaul. “Peace be Upon You, Exalted Angels’: On *Hekhalot*, Liturgy and Incantation Bowls,” in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, vol. 2, no. 3 (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck] 1995).

A bibliography of Jewish magic, which is far more extensive than mine here (and which is not limited to English sources), has been prepared by Alex Jassen, Mary Gates, Jacob Rennaker, and Scott Noegel of University of Washington [Seattle]—online at <http://faculty.washington.edu/snoegel/JewishMagicBibliography.pdf>. Works to 2010 are divided according to period and topic.

## Jewish Magic—A Selection of English Sources

- Alexander, Philip S. “The Talmudic Concept of Conjuring (*’Abizat Einayim*) and the Problem of the Definition of Magic (*Kishuf*),” in *Creation and Re-Creation in Jewish Thought* [FESTSCHRIFT IN HONOR OF JOSEPH DAN ON THE OCCASION OF HIS SEVENTIETH BIRTHDAY], edited by Rachel Elior and Peter Schäfer. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005.
- Ben-Amos, Dan. “On Demons,” in *Creation and Re-Creation in Jewish Thought* (see immediately above).
- Bloom, Maureen. *Jewish Mysticism and Magic: An Anthropological Perspective* [ROUTLEDGE JEWISH STUDIES SERIES]. London – New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Bohak, Gideon. *Ancient Jewish Magic: A History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Remains of Greek Words and Magical Formulae in Hekhalot Literature,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, vol. 6, edited by D. Abrams and A. Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2001).
- Budge, E. A. Wallis. *Amulets and Talismans*. (As *Amulets and Superstitions*), Oxford and Cambridge: 1930; rpt. New York: Collier Books, The Macmillan Co., 1970.
- Conybeare, F. C. “The Testament of Solomon,” in *Jewish Quarterly Review*, vol. 11 (1898).
- Daiches, Samuel. *Babylonian Oil Magic in the Talmud and in the Later Jewish Literature* [PUBLICATION No. 5] London: Jews’ College, 1913.
- Dulling, D. C. “Testament of Solomon,” in *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, Volume 1, edited by James H. Charlesworth (Garden City: Doubleday and Company, 1983).
- Dureau, Yona. “The Talisman or the Word as an Object and as an Image-Signifier,” in *Semiotica*, volume 139—1/4 (The Hague: Walter de Gruyter, 2002); pp. 23-62.
- Fishbane, Michael. “Aspects of Jewish Magic the Ancient Rabbinic Period,” in *The Solomon Goldman Lectures*, vol. II, edited by Nathaniel Stampfer (Chicago: The Spertus College of Judaism Press, 1979).
- Gager, John G. “Moses the Magician: Hero of an Ancient Counter-Culture?” in *Helios*, vol. 21, no. 2 (1994).
- Gaster, Moses. *Studies and Texts in Folklore, Magic, Medieval Romance, Hebrew Apocrypha, and Samaritan Archaeology*. London: Maggs Brothers, 1925-8; rpt. New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1971:
  - VOLUME 1, pp. 338-55, “Wisdom of the Chaldeans”
  - VOLUME 1, pp. 365-68, “A Note on a Hebrew Amulet”
  - VOLUME 1, pp. 387-461, “Samaritan Phylacteries and Amulets”
  - VOLUME 2, pp. 1005-38, “Two Thousand Years of a Charm against a Child-Stealing Witch”
- Goldin, Judah. “The Magic of Magic and Superstition,” in
  - *Aspects of Religious Propaganda in Judaism and Early Christianity*, edited by E. S. Fiorenza (University of Notre Dame, 1976); and
  - *Studies in Midrash and Related Literature*, edited by B. Eichler and J. Tigay (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1988).
- Goldish, Matt (ed). *Spirit Possession in Judaism: Cases and Contexts from the Middle Ages to the Present*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2003..
- Goldmerstein, L. “Magical Sacrifices in the Jewish Kabbala,” in *Folklore* 7 (1896; includes a translated extract of *Sefer Raziel Hamalakh*).
- Green, Abraham. *Judaic Artifacts: Unlocking the Secrets of Judaic Charms and Amulets*. Includes a CD for electronic research. Hod Hasharon: Astrolog Publishing House, 2004.

- Guillaume, Alfred. *Prophecy and Divination among the Hebrews and Other Semites*. New York – London: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1938.
- Harari, Yuval. “A Different Spirituality or ‘Other’ Agents? On the Study of Magic in Rabbinic Literature,” in *With Letters of Light: Studies in the Dead Sea Scrolls, Early Jewish Apocalypticism, Magic, and Mysticism in Honor of Rachel Elior* [EKSTASIS: RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE FROM ANTIQUITY TO THE MIDDLE AGES, vol. 2], edited by Daphna V. Arbel and Andrei A. Orlov (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co., 2011).
- Hirschman, Jack. *The Book of Noah* [TREE TEXTS: 1]. Berkeley: Berkeley/Tree, 1975 (selections, including two hymns, from *Sefer Raziel*).
- Idel, Moshe. *Golem: Jewish Magical and Mystical Traditions on the Artificial Anthropoid*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Kabbalah: A Short Introduction with an Emphasis on Its Magical Aspects,” in *Kabbalah: Mysticism in Jewish Life*, An Exhibition at the Herbert and Eileen Bernard Museum of Judaica [November 4, 2003 – January 30, 2004]. New York: Congregation Emanu-El of the City of New York, 2003.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Magic and Kabbalah in the *Book of the Responding Entity*,” in *The Solomon Goldman Lectures*, vol. VI, edited by Mayer I. Gruber (Chicago: The Spertus College of Judaism Press, 1993).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “The Origin of Alchemy according to Zosimos and a Hebrew Parallel,” in *Review des études juives*, vol. 145, nos. 1-2 (Paris: 1986) AND included as CHAPTER 8 of Arturo Schwartz’ *Kabbalah and Alchemy. An Essay on Common Archetypes* (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 2000): Chapter 8.
- Janowitz, Naomi. *Magic in the Roman World* [RELIGION IN THE FIRST CHRISTIAN CENTURIES]. London – New York: Routledge, 2001. (See also Janowitz’ *Icons of Power*, listed above.)
- Jewell, Philip. “Flavius Josephus’ Terminology of Magic,” in *Journal for the Academic Study of Magic*, Issue 5, edited by Susan Johnson Graf and Amy Hale (Oxford: Mandrake of Oxford, 2009).
- Kanarfogel, Ephraim. “Peering through the Lattices”: *Mystical, Magical, and Pietistic Dimensions in the Tosafist Period*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2000.
- Kern-Ulmer, Brigitte (Rivka). “The Depiction of Magic in Rabbinic Texts: The Rabbinic and the Greek Concept of Magic,” in *Journal for the Study of Judaism*, vol. 27, no. 3 (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996).
- Klutz, Todd E. (ed) *Magic in the Biblical World: From the Rod of Aaron to the Ring of Solomon*. London: T & T Clark International, 2003.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Rewriting the TESTAMENT OF SOLOMON: Tradition, Conflict and Identity in a Late Antique Pseudepigraphon* [LIBRARY OF SECOND TEMPLE STUDIES, 53]. London – New York: T & T Clark, 2005.
- Mastrocinque, Attilio. *From Jewish Magic to Gnosticism* [STUDIEN UND TEXTE ZU ANTIKE UND CHRISTENTUM 24]. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005.
- Meyer, Marvin; and Mirecki, Paul (eds). *Ancient Magic and Ritual Power* [RELIGIONS IN THE GRECO-ROMAN WORLD, volume 129]. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995 (see especially Part Three: “Magic and Ritual Power in Judaism and Early Christianity”).
- Naveh, Joseph; and Shaked, Shaul. *Amulets and Magic Bowls. Aramaic Incantations of Late Antiquity*. 1985; (2<sup>nd</sup> ed) Jerusalem: Magnes Press, The Hebrew University, 1987.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Magic Spells and Formulae. Aramaic Incantations of Late Antiquity*. Jerusalem: Magnes Press, The Hebrew University, 1993.
- Ness, Lester. *Written in the Stars: Ancient Zodiac Mosaics* [MARCO POLO MONOGRAPHS, no. 1]. Warren Center: Shangri-La Publications, 1999.
- Neusner, Jacob. “Science and Magic, Miracle and Magic in Formative Judaism: The System and the Difference,” in *Religion, Science and Magic: In Concert and in Conflict*, edited by J. Neusner, E. Frerichs, and P. Flesher (Oxford/New York: Oxford University Press, 1989).

- Patai, Raphael. *The Jewish Alchemists. A History and Source Book*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994.
- Pilcher, E. J. "Two Kabbalistic Planetary Charms," in *Proceedings of the Society of Biblical Archaeology* 28 (London: 1906).
- Polzer, Natalie C. THE BIBLE IN THE ARAMAIC MAGIC BOWLS. M.A. thesis. (Montreal: McGill University, August 1986).
- Rohrbacher-Sticker, Claudia. "From Sense to Nonsense, From Incantation Prayer to Magical Spell," in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, vol. 3, no. 1 (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck] 1996).
- Schäfer, Peter. "The Magic of the Golem: The Early Development of the Golem Legend," in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 46, nos. 1-2 (The Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies, 1995).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Merkavah Mysticism and Magic," in *Gershom Scholem's MAJOR TRENDS IN JEWISH MYSTICISM 50 Years After*, edited by J. Dan and P. Schäfer (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck] 1993).
- Schiffman, Lawrence; and Swartz, Michael. *Hebrew and Aramaic Incantation Texts: Selected Texts from Taylor-Schechter Box K1*. Sheffield: JSOT Press (Sheffield Academic Press), 1992.
- Scholem, Gershom. "Some Sources of Jewish-Arabic Demonology," in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 16 (The Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies, 1965; English introduction to Hebrew texts).
- Schrire, T. *Hebrew Magic Amulets* (as *Hebrew Amulets*), London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1966; rpt. New York: Behrman House, 1982.
- Schwartz, Dov. *Studies on Astral Magic in Medieval Jewish Thought*, [BRILL REFERENCE LIBRARY OF JUDAISM, 20] Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 2005.
- Seidel, Jonathan Lee. STUDIES IN ANCIENT JEWISH MAGIC. (Ph.D dissertation, Berkeley: University of California, 1996)
- Shaked, Shaul. "An Early Magic Fragment from the Cairo Geniza," in *Occident and Orient: A Tribute to the Memory of A. Scheiber*, edited by Robert Dan (Budapest – Leiden: Akadmiai Kiado/E. J. Brill, 1988).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Jews, Christians and Pagans in the Aramaic Incantations Bowls of the Sasanian Period," in *Religions and Cultures: First International Conference of MEDITERRANEUM*, edited by Adriana Destro and Mauro Pesce [Academic Studies and the Social Order], Binghamton: Global Publications, Binghamton University, 2000.
- \_\_\_\_\_. (ed). *Officina Magica: Essays on the Practice of Magic in Antiquity* [STUDIES IN JUDAICA 4]. Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2005.
- Sharot, Stephen. *Messianism, Mysticism, and Magic. A Sociological Analysis of Jewish Religious Movements* [STUDIES IN RELIGION]. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1982.
- Shatzmiller, Joseph. "In Search of the 'Book of Figures': Medicine and Astrology in Montpellier at the Turn of the Fourteenth Century," in *AJS Review*, Volume Seven-Eight, edited by Frank Talmage (Cambridge: Association for Jewish Studies, 1982-1983).
- Smith, Morton. "The Jewish Elements in the Magical Papyri," in
  - *Society of Biblical Literature 1986 Seminar Papers*, no. 25; and
  - (idem) *Studies in the Cult of Yahweh* [RELIGIONS IN THE GRECO-ROMAN WORLD, 130/2] edited by Shaye J. D. Cohen (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996): Volume 2. See also Hans Dieter Betz, "Jewish Magic in the Greek Magical Papyri (PGM VII.260-71)" in *Envisioning Magic* (listed above, page 28).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "A Note on Some Jewish Assimilationists: The Angels (P. Berlin 5025b, P. Louvre 2391)" in
  - *Journal of the Ancient Near East Society*, 16-17 (1984); and
  - (idem) *Studies in the Cult of Yahweh*, Volume 2 (see above)

*Societas Magica Newsletter*, Issue 10, Spring 2003: JEWISH MAGIC: A *PERSPECTIVES SYMPOSIUM* (—online at <http://www.societasmagica.org/>), which contains the following articles:

- Swartz, Michael D. “A Magic All Its Own”
- Lesses, Rebecca. “Jewish Magic and Multiculturalism in the Ancient World”
- Kanarfogel, Ephraim. “Magic in the Rabbinic Culture of Medieval Ashkenaz”

*Societas Magica Newsletter*, Issue 19, Spring 2008 (—online at <http://www.societasmagica.org/>) which contains

- Durov, Victoria. “Codicological Notes on the Text of a Hebrew Magic Manual: A New Perspective?”

Swartz, Michael D. “Book and Tradition in Hekhalot and Magical Literature,” in *The Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, vol. 3, issue 2, edited by E. Wolfson and P. Mendes-Flohr (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1993).

\_\_\_\_\_. “The Dead Sea Scrolls and Later Jewish Magic and Mysticism,” in *Dead Sea Discoveries*, vol. 8, no. 2 (Leiden: Brill NV, 2001).

\_\_\_\_\_. “Sacrificial Themes in Jewish Magic,” in *Magic and Ritual in the Ancient World*, part 4, edited by Paul Allan Mirecki and Marvin W. Meyer (Leiden – Boston – Koln: Brill, 2001)

\_\_\_\_\_. “Scribal Magic and Its Rhetoric: Formal Patterns in Medieval Hebrew and Aramaic Incantation Texts from the Cairo Genizah,” in *Harvard Theological Review*, vol. 83, no. 2 (Cambridge: 1990).

Thompson, C. J. S. *The Mysteries and Secrets of Magic*. London: John Lane, 1927; New York: Causeway Books, 1973; New York: Cosimo Inc., 2005.

Trachtenberg, Joshua. *Jewish Magic and Superstition: A Study in Folk Religion*. New York: Behrman’s Jewish Book House, 1939; rpt. New York: Atheneum, 1970; rpt. with a foreword by Moshe Idel, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004.

Urbach, Ephraim E. “Chapter VI: Magic and Miracle,” in *The Sages, Their Concepts and Beliefs*. English edition: Jerusalem: Magnes Press, 1975; rpt. Cambridge – London: Harvard University Press, 1987.

Vukosavović, Filip. *Angels and Demons: Jewish Magic through the Ages*. Jerusalem: Bible Lands Museum, 2010.

Verman, Mark; and Adler, Shulamit H. “Path Jumping in the Jewish Magical Tradition,” in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, vol. 1, no. 1 (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck] 1993/4).

Wasserman, Steven M. “The Magical Texts in the Cairo Genizah,” in *Genizah Research after Ninety Years: The Case of Judaeo-Arabic* [PAPERS READ AT THE THIRD CONGRESS OF THE SOCIETY FOR JUDAEO-ARABIC STUDIES], edited by Joseph Blau and Stefan C. Reif. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Zohar, Zion. “*Pulsa De-Nura*: The Innovation of Modern Magic and Ritual,” in *Modern Judaism*, Volume 27, Number 1 (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, Feb. 2007).

## Appendix 2

### THE 1982 VERSION OF Notes on the Study of *Merkabah* Mysticism and *Hekhalot* Literature

from *A Guide to Kabbalistic Books in English: 1977-1979*, by Don Karr (Ithaca: 1982),  
pages 37-40

Additions from the slightly expanded version in *Collected Articles on the Kabbalah*,  
VOLUME 1, by D. Karr (Ithaca: KoM #5, 1985), pages 17-20, are shown in brackets.

1. Merkabah mysticism is the name of a mystical movement within Judaism's Talmudic and Gaonic Periods (ca. 100-1000 c. e.). This school produced what is called the Hekhalot literature.
2. This mysticism, ma'aseh merkabah (work of the chariot), is mentioned in the Mishna itself (in Hagigah 2:1):  
  
The work of creation (ma'aseh bereshit) may not be expounded in the presence of two or more. The description of the chariot (merkabah) may not be expounded even in the presence of one, unless he is a sage who already understands out of his own insights.  
(quoted from Lipman, Eugene. THE MISHNAH, ORAL TEACHING OF JUDAISM. [New York:] Schocken, 1974, p. 150)
3. Implied in this quote is that merkabah mysticism, though guarded, was not outside of the rabbinic tradition. One gets the impression that it was even thought of as the supreme mystery.
4. Just as the work of creation comprised mystical speculation on the first part of Genesis, work of the chariot comprised mystical speculation on, and amplification of, the first chapter of Ezekiel.
5. The literature of this school describes the mystical journey through various heavens and palaces (hekhalot) leading to the ultimate vision of the throne and chariot, and, in some cases, "the figure in the form of a man" (Ezekiel 1:26).

6. It is not the purpose of this short paper to go into detail about the development of the merkabah school or the contents of the Hekhalot texts. To a greater extent than I am capable, this work has already been done. My purpose is to inform the reader of where to look for information on the various facets of study pertaining to merkabah mysticism. I have limited myself to English sources.
7. Historical and scholarly overviews: as it is with any study in the field of Jewish mysticism, the best place to start the investigation of merkabah mysticism is in the works of Gershom Scholem. Two of his works give excellent synopses of the subject:

MAJOR TRENDS IN JEWISH MYSTICISM (1941, Schocken repr.) Lecture 2. Merkabah Mysticism and Jewish Gnosticism.

KABBALAH (1974, Meridian repr.) pp. 8-21, and article: Merkabah Mysticism, pp. 373-6.

For a closer look at some of the topics and scholarly concerns in merkabah mysticism, see Scholem's

JEWISH GNOSTICISM, MERKABAH MYSTICISM, AND TALMUDIC TRADITION (1965, Jewish Theological Seminary).

KABBALAH (as above), articles:  
 Chiromancy, pp. 317-9.  
 Meditation, pp. 369-72.  
 Metatron, pp. 377-81.

[Add to these

Gruenwald, Ithamar. APOCALYPTIC AND MERKAVAH MYSTICISM (1980, E. J. Brill).]

8. There are a few articles and one book that analyze the connections of merkabah mysticism with the rabbinic (i.e. Talmudic, etc.) tradition:

[Bokser, Ben Zion. THE JEWISH MYSTICAL TRADITION 1981 Pilgrim Press) Chapter 2. The Talmud.  
 Talmudic "work of the chariot" segments are translated and introduced.]

[Halperin, David J. THE MERKABAH IN RABBINIC LITERATURE. (1980, American Oriental Society)  
 This is a close scholarly analysis of the references to merkabah mysticism in the Mishna: Hagigah 2:1, the

Tosefta: Hagigah 2:1-7, the Palestinian Talmud 77 a-d, and the Babylonian Talmud 11b-16a.]

Levy, Samson H. The Best Kept Secret of the Rabbinic Tradition, in JUDAISM 21 (4) 1972.

This takes a look at the strange case of Rabbi Simeon ben Zoma, who entered into PRDS (paradise) but came out of it "stricken."

Neusner, Jacob. The Development of the Merkavah Tradition, in THE STUDY OF JUDAISM in the Persian, Hellenistic and Roman Period, vol 11 (2), 1971, Leiden.

Four versions of the story of Yohanan ben Zakkai and the merkabah-sermon of his disciple Eleazer ben Arakh are presented and compared to demonstrate that such a story accumulates more and more detail as it passes from earlier to later versions.

9. In JEWISH GNOSTICISM... Scholem lists eight texts belonging to the Hekhalot literature. I shall list them here, adding one (Shiur Qoma), indicating research sources, if any exist:

a) The Visions of Ezekiel, a mystical midrash on Ezekiel 1:1, see:

Jacobs, Louis. JEWISH MYSTICAL TESTIMONIES (1977, Schocken) Chapter Three: The Riders of the Chariot and Those Who Enter the Heavenly Halls.  
Introduction and text of Visions...

Marmorstein, A. A Fragment of the Visions of Ezekiel, in JEWISH QUARTERLY REVIEW, New Series #8 (1917-18). Translation and discussion.

b) The Lesser Hekhalot, possibly the oldest. In English, there are only spot translations in Scholem's JEWISH GNOSTICISM... and MAJOR TRENDS...

c) The Greater Hekhalot, the best covered of the texts for our purposes. Besides spot translations (see Scholem as listed in b) there are

Blumenthal, David R. UNDERSTANDING JEWISH MYSTICISM: A Source Reader (1978, Ktav) [pp. 53-91]  
Blumenthal introduces and presents translations of The Greater Hekhalot, Chs. 15-29:5.

[Kaplan, Aryeh. MEDITATION AND KABBALAH. (1982, Weiser) pp. 41-54. Kaplan introduces the Greater Hekhalot and translates Chapters 1, 2, and 16-26.]

Schiffman, Lawrence. The Recall of Rabbi Nehuniah ha-Qanah from Ecstasy in the Hekhalot Rabbati, in AJS REVIEW vol I, 1976.

In Hekhalot Rabbati, R. Nehuniah is pulled out of his ecstasy by his disciples by making him ever-so-slightly ritually impure. This tale is given scholarly treatment in Schiffman's article.

Smith, Morton. Observations on Hekhalot Rabbati, in BIBLICAL AND OTHER STUDIES, ed. A. Altmann (Harvard U. Press, 1963). This [article] summarizes and analyzes the contents [of Hekhalot Rabbati], presenting a translated excerpt of The Great Magical Papyrus of Paris for the sake of comparison.

(M. Smith has translated The Greater Hekhalot in its entirety, but it has not been published.

Indeed, it exists, as far as I know, in typescript, with corrections jotted in the margins and scribbled over the text by Gershom Scholem.)

- d) Merkabah Rabbah. I know of no English sources for this.
- e) A titleless Hekhalot. Scholem gives a transcription of this text in Hebrew in an appendix to JEWISH Gnosticism..., but I know of no other sources for information on this.
- f) Chapter on physiognomics and chiromancy, published in Hebrew by Scholem, but no English translation. See, however, Scholem's article: Chiromancy in KABBALAH.
- g) Book of the Hekhalot, called also 3 Enoch or the Hebrew Book of Enoch. One of the latest of the texts. Full scholarly treatment and translation of this appear in

Odeberg, Hugo. 3 ENOCH or THE HEBREW BOOK OF ENOCH (1928, Ktav repr. [1973])

- h) The Treatise of the Hekhalot, the latest of the texts. Published, and translated into German, but not into English.
- i) Shiur Qoma, a strange treatise listing the dimensions and secret names of the deity's various members. See

Meltzer, David (ed) THE SECRET GARDEN (1977, Seabury) pp. 23-37 for a translation of the text.

For scholarly studies on Shiur Qoma, see

Loewe, Raphael. The Divine Garment and Shi'ur Qomah, in HARVARD THEOLOGICAL REVIEW 58 (1965)

Scholem. JEWISH Gnosticism... (as above) chapter VI: The Age of Shiur Komah Speculation and a passage in Origen.

A 14th-century commentary on Shiur Qoma by Moses b. Joshua b. Mar David of Narbonne is translated in

Altmann, A. (ed) JEWISH MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE STUDIES 4 (1967) pp. 225-88.

Shiur Qoma's symbolism is based on the details of "the beloved" in Song of Songs 5:11-16. The basis of the dimensions given is derived from Psalm 147:5; since the phrase in that passage adds up to 236, via gematria, this is the root of Shiur Qoma's calculations.